

Eighteenth-Century Scotland

The Newsletter of the Eighteenth-Century Scottish Studies Society

Number 2 (Spring 1988)

ECSSS on the Beach

"The Social World of the Scottish Enlightenment"

ECSSS's first conference, jointly sponsored by the Institute of Scottish Studies at Old Dominion University, was a smashing success! The "Social World of the Scottish Enlightenment" was the theme of the meeting, held during the first week of April. The site was Virginia Beach, Virginia, where participants and guests from around the USA and the world came together for several days of intellectual and social interchange.

The conference began on the evening of 6 April with a keynote address by Horst Drescher, the distinguished Henry Mackenzie scholar from the University of Mainz. This was followed by a reception sponsored by friends of the Institute of Scottish Studies and attended by Myron Henry, Old Dominion University's Vice-President for Academic Affairs. The following day Ian Ross (British Columbia) chaired a session on literary perceptions that featured four speakers: G. Ross Roy (South Carolina) on Ossian, James Basker (Barnard) on Scotticisms, Andrew Noble (Strathclyde) on Boswell, and Thomas Richardson (North Carolina State) on images of clergymen in early nineteenth-century Scottish fiction. After an excellent conference luncheon, marred only by the failure of the luncheon speaker--Marcia Allentuck--to appear, Richard Sher (New Jersey Institute of Technology) chaired a session on sociable relations, with talks by Susan Purviance (Toledo) on Hutcheson's ideas of sociability, Jeffrey Smitten (Texas Tech) on the rhetorical underpinnings of Hume's *Dialogues*, and John Dwyer (British Columbia) on "the imperative of sociability" in enlightened Scotland. The afternoon came to a close with a well-attended ECSSS business meeting (see below).

That evening was unquestionably one of the highlights of the conference. The President of Old Dominion University, Joseph Marchello, and his wife graciously invited the conference participants to their lovely home on the campus, where they were treated to a magnificent array of Scottish foods, including Scotch salmon, Scotch eggs, and pheasant stew. Guests also enjoyed the homemade entertainment, as ECSSS president Ian Ross joined

Mrs. Marchello, David Daiches, and others in some outstanding exhibitions of Scottish dancing.

On the morning of 8 April it was back to business, as Roger Fechner (Adrian Coll.) chaired a session on American connections. There were presentations by Linda Null (Tennessee Tech) on Boswell's reputation in America, Ned Landsman (SUNY, Stony Brook) on Witherspoon and the evangelical enlightenment, and Shannon Stimson (Harvard) on James Wilson's debt to Thomas Reid. The afternoon was given over to a conference trip to colonial Williamsburg, which was much enjoyed by all those participating despite the dreary weather.

The final day of the conference began with Paul Wood (Queen's) in the chair of a session on Aberdonian philosophers. The speakers were Roger Emerson (Western Ontario) on the workings of academic patronage and Peter Diamond (Utah) on Reid's social thought. At the conference luncheon that followed, guests heard a stimulating address by David Daiches (National Humanities Center) on the uses of eighteenth-century rhetoric in early American political language. Carol McGuirk (Florida Atlantic) chaired the afternoon session on Burns, which featured Kenneth Simpson (Strathclyde) on Burns and Scottish society and a special presentation by John Ashmead and John Davison (Haverford) on Burns's love songs, beautifully sung by their former student Shoshana Shay.

The conference concluded in grand style with a Saturday night banquet. The keynote address on Hume's aesthetics was presented by Peter Jones (Edinburgh), the Director of the Institute of Advanced Studies that two years ago hosted the largest Scottish Enlightenment conference ever held, "IPSE86." Two ECSSS members were honored at the banquet. Ross Roy received the Robert Bruce Award from the Institute of Scottish Studies, and David Daiches received ECSSS's first Lifetime Achievement Award (see below).

This was far and away the most important conference on the Scottish Enlightenment ever held in North America. Its success owed much to the efforts of the Director of the Institute of Scottish Studies, Charles Haws. He and his staff took charge of all arrangements

for meals, meeting rooms, and accommodations, produced the handsome conference program, provided transportation to events held away from the conference site, and made it possible for the keynote speakers to attend. ECSSS wishes to thank him for all he did to make the conference work so well. We also wish to thank President Marchello and the many others at ODU who gave so much of their time and energy to "The Social World of the Scottish Enlightenment."

Emerson, Smitten Elected

At the annual ECSSS business meeting held in Virginia Beach on 7 April, Roger Emerson (History) and Jeffrey Smitten (Literature) were elected to two-year terms as ECSSS president and vice-president, respectively. They replace outgoing president Ian Ross (Literature) and outgoing vice-president Roger Fechner (History), who were both founding members of the society, and whose services to it have been great indeed. Also elected to two-year terms were members-at-large Susan Purviance (Philosophy) and Robert Kent Donovan (History). Richard Sher was re-elected executive secretary.

In other business, the membership authorized the executive secretary to negotiate with publishers and journals regarding the possibility of publishing the proceedings, or partial proceedings, of the Virginia Beach conference. The membership also approved plans for the 1989 meeting in New Orleans and the 1990 conference in Glasgow (see below).

At a meeting of the executive board on the final day of the conference, agreement was reached on a rough draft of the society's bylaws, which will be completed and implemented in the near future. The board also voted to designate the following three individuals "corresponding members" in honor of their contributions and leadership in their respective geographic regions: Horst Drescher of University of Mainz (Germany and Europe); Hiroshi Mizuta of Meijo University (Japan and Asia); and Andrew Noble of Strathclyde University (Scotland and the British Isles).

Daiches Honored

When David Daiches stepped forward to receive ECSSS's first Lifetime Achievement Award at the banquet climaxing the Virginia Beach conference, there was a widespread belief among those present that few awards are ever so richly deserved. Over a long academic career in Scotland, England, and the United States, this scholar has done as much as anyone to bring Scottish literature and culture to life. Bonnie Prince Charlie, Boswell,

Burns, Fergusson, and Scott, Edinburgh, Glasgow, and the Union of 1707, are just a few of the many eighteenth-century people, places, and events forming the subjects of books he has written over the years.

Perhaps Professor Daiches's greatest contribution to eighteenth-century Scottish studies was the stimulating series of lectures that he published in book form in 1964 as *The Paradox of Scottish Culture: The Eighteenth-Century Experience*. There he explored the fascinating concept of "cultural schizophrenia" among eighteenth-century Scotland's men of letters, who were shown to be deeply torn between native Scottish and polite English approaches to language and literary taste.

ECSSS president Ian Ross presented David Daiches with a handsome plaque commemorating his many contributions to eighteenth-century Scottish studies. Admirers of his work will be pleased to know that Professor Daiches is currently completing a new book dealing with the impact of eighteenth-century Scottish rhetoric on early American political writing, to be published next year by Edinburgh University Press under the same title as his conference lecture, *Scottish Rhetoric and American Independence*.

ECSSS to Meet at New Orleans & Glasgow

In 1989 ECSSS will meet in New Orleans at the annual meeting of the American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies (Sheraton Hotel, 29 March-2 April), of which ECSSS is an affiliated society. ECSSS will sponsor sessions on "Scotland and Revolution" and "Philosophy and Culture in Scotland." Those interested in participating in the first of these sessions should immediately contact Roger Emerson (Dept of History, University of Western Ontario, London, Ontario, Canada), stating the title of the proposed paper and a brief abstract of its contents. For the second session contact Richard Sher. The conference organizer is Jim Borck of the English Department at Louisiana State University.

In addition to sponsoring these sessions, ECSSS will hold a luncheon/business meeting at New Orleans on Friday, 31 March, with a guest speaker to be announced. We hope all ECSSS members at the conference will plan to attend. Details will be announced in the conference program that all ASECS members will receive. For ASECS membership information, write to the Executive Secretary, ASECS, St. Olaf College, Northfield, MN 55057.

In the summer of 1990 ECSSS will meet in Glasgow for a conference on "Glasgow and the Enlightenment."

The conference will be hosted by the University of Strathclyde, which formally invited ECSSS to hold the conference there as *Eighteenth-Century Scotland* was about to go to press. Details of the conference remain to be worked out, but it is likely that there will be considerable emphasis on science and technology, religious piety, economic issues, and other topics of particular importance in the Glasgow context. At least one session of the conference will be devoted to a celebration of the bicentennial of Adam Smith's death in 1790.

Further details on the Glasgow conference will appear in next year's newsletter or a separate mailing. But it is not too early to begin planning now for a spot on the Glasgow program. In 1990 Glasgow will be "European Cultural Capital," and there will be many other exciting activities taking place throughout the summer. If you wish to participate, write to the executive secretary, including the title and a brief abstract of the paper you wish to deliver.

The Conference Scene

The Knoxville ASECS Meeting

There was an exceptionally strong Scottish studies presence at this year's annual meeting of the American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies in Knoxville, Tennessee (20-24 April). ECSSS sponsored a session on "Scientific Methodology in the Scottish Enlightenment" that was organized and chaired by Henry Fulton (Central Michigan). The session consisted of two papers: Philip Flynn (Delaware), "The Dugald Stewart-Francis Jeffrey Debate on Scotland's Science of Mind" and Roger Emerson, "Science and the Scottish Moralists." Commentary was delivered by Arthur Donovan (Merchant Marine Academy).

Another session at the conference, on "Scotland and the South," included a paper by Steve Hicks (George Mason) on the influence of Sir Walter Scott's novels in the antebellum period. Other ECSSS members who read papers on Scottish themes were Gordon Turnbull (Yale) and Irma Lustig (Pennsylvania) on Boswell, John Radner (George Mason) on Johnson in the Hebrides, Constant Noble Stockton (Wisconsin at River Falls) on Witherspoon, and Don Livingston on Hume. Still other ECSSS members who participated in the conference were Mary Margaret Stewart (Gettysburg), Robert C. Maecubbin (William and Mary), and Thomas Jemielity (Notre Dame).

ECSSS was well represented at the meeting of affiliated societies by its new president, Roger Emerson,

and its outgoing vice-president, Roger Fechner. Particular thanks are due once again to T.E.D. Braun, chair of the ASECS Affiliate Societies Committee, for the strong support he has given ECSSS.

ESHSS on Women, Northern Scotland

In March the Economic and Social History Society in Scotland sponsored a one-day conference on "Women and Scottish Society: Historical Perspectives" at the Mitchell Library in Glasgow. There were three talks by ECSSS members: Jane Rendall (York), "Sex, Gender and Rewriting History"; Leah Leneman (St. Andrews), "Two Sides of a Coin: Women's Position in Early Modern Scotland"; and Christopher Whatley (Dundee), "Finding Women in Historical Sources."

In September 1987 ESHSS held a longer conference at the University of Aberdeen on "The Economy of the North of Scotland since 1700." Among the ECSSS members participating were T. M. Devine, Christopher Smout, R. H. Campbell, Rosalind Mitchison, and C.W.J. Withers.

To join ESHSS (including subscriptions to *Scottish Economic and Social History* and the society's newsletter), write: Subscription Secretary, ESHSS, Department of Scottish History, University of Glasgow, Glasgow G12 8RT, Scotland. The ESHSS newsletter is edited by A. S. Blyth (Department of Business Studies, Dollar Academy, Dollar, Scotland), who would appreciate receiving announcements of relevant forthcoming events.

Boswell at the MLA (and Beyond)

Last December ECSSS member Gregory Clingham (Fordham) organized a session on "Boswell and the Scottish Enlightenment" at the Modern Language Association meeting in San Francisco. The program included Richard Schwartz on "Boswell and Hume," Gordon Turnbull on "Boswell and Sympathy," and Thomas Curley on "Boswell's Liberty-Loving Account of Corsica"--plus commentary by Simon Varey. All of these scholars, as well as ECSSS members Thomas Crawford, Marlies Danziger, David Daiches, Joan Pittock, and Richard Sher, are slated to contribute to Greg Clingham's forthcoming collection, *New Light on Boswell*, to be published by Cambridge University Press.

The Boswell community was hard hit by the deaths of Frank Brady in 1986 and Frederick Pottle in 1987, both of whom will be sorely missed. There is, however, a good deal of happier news about the state of Boswell studies in the January newsletter of the Yale Boswell Papers. In matters concerning ECSSS members, Nicholas Phillipson (Edinburgh) has been appointed to the Advisory Com-

mittee, and Marlies Danziger (Hunter) has recently completed editing (with the late Frank Brady) the last volume of Boswell's journals, covering the period 1789-1795. To get on the newsletter mailing list, write to the new managing editor, Rachel McClellan, Yale Editions of the Private Papers of James Boswell, Yale University Library, 1603A Yale Station, New Haven, CT 06520.

Strathclyde History Seminars

This year the History Department at University of Strathclyde, Glasgow, offered a seminar series on "Scottish Society, c. 1650-1850" that featured presentations by six ECSSS members: Rosalind Mitchison (Edinburgh), "Sex and the Single Girl in Early Modern Scotland"; Rab Houston (St. Andrews), "The Development of Literacy: Scotland and Europe, 1600-1800"; Andrew Noble (Strathclyde), "Dissent and the Scottish Enlightenment"; Christopher Smout (St. Andrews), "Problems of Nationalism, Identity and Improvement in Scotland, 1780-1830"; Tom Markus (Strathclyde), "Class and Classification in the Buildings of the Late Scottish Enlightenment"; and Tom Devine (Strathclyde), "The New Elite in the Western Highlands and Islands, 1790-1860."

Protest and Dissent at St. Andrews

Last October the Association of Scottish Historical Studies at St. Andrews University sponsored a one-day symposium on "Dissent, Protest and Rebellion in Pre-Industrial Scotland." This was the inaugural event of ASHS, which was founded at St. Andrews "to promote an integrative approach to the social, cultural and political history of Scotland." In keeping with the society's avowed aim, the symposium was both interdisciplinary and chronologically comprehensive, spanning the period from the Middle Ages through the beginning of the Industrial Revolution. Papers with a bearing on the eighteenth century included Christopher Whatley, "The Extent and Varieties of Protest in Eighteenth-Century Scotland"; Andrew Noble, "Dissent in the Enlightenment"; and John Brims (St. Andrews), "The Covenanting Tradition in Radical Thought."

As we prepared to go to press, word came of ASHS's new symposium on "Settlement and Society in Scotland: Migration, Colonisation and Integration," to be held on 1 October 1988 at the University of Glasgow.

Individuals wishing to attend the conference or to be on the mailing list of ASHS should write to Roger Mason, ASHS, Department of Scottish History, St. Andrews University, St. Andrews, Scotland.

Culture and Revolution at Aberdeen

The Cultural History Group of the University of Aberdeen is holding its third annual conference, 12-16 July 1988. Its general theme is "Culture and Revolution." Suggestions from would-be contributors are invited on revolution during the period 1680 to 1815 (analyses or case studies) or on revolution in the Northeast of Scotland during the same period. Papers should be approximately twenty minutes in length. The papers of the 1986 conference have been published (see book review in this issue), and those of the 1987 conference are also in preparation. It is hoped that the 1988 conference will also be published.

For further information contact Joan Pittock Wesson, Convener, Cultural History Group, University of Aberdeen, Old Aberdeen AB9 2UB, Scotland.

Friends of Robert Smith

The annual birthday party for early Philadelphia's greatest architect/builder, Robert Smith, was held at Carpenters' Hall in Philadelphia on 14 January. Visitors enjoyed tea and oatcakes, a Scottish buffet lunch, songs by the Philadelphia Scottish Choir, piping by James R. Ross and Dennis Hangey, and an illustrated lecture by the acclaimed architectural historian, William Seale, on the Scottish contribution to the building of Washington, D.C.

As usual, the affair was run by the founder and president of the Friends of Robert Smith, Charles Peterson. Additional support came from the Scottish Historic and Research Society of the Delaware Valley, which is headed by Frederick Gill and Blair Stonier.

Hume Heading for Australia

Knud Haakonssen of the History of Ideas Unit of The Australian National University has written to inform fellow ECSSS members that the Hume Society will meet at his university in August 1990. All inquiries should be addressed to Knud Haakonssen at the above department, GPO Box 4, Canberra, ACT 2601, Australia.

ECSSS has also been in touch with the executive director of the Hume Society, Dorothy Coleman, about the possibility of a joint Hume Society-ECSSS conference in the early 1990s. A possible title for such a conference might be "Hume in a Scottish Setting." For more information about joining the Hume Society (which will hold its 1988 meeting in Marburg, West Germany, from 15-19 August), write to Dorothy Coleman, Department of Philosophy, Bowdoin College, Brunswick, ME 04011.

Summer Study in Scotland

STS at Strathclyde

This summer New Jersey Institute of Technology and the University of Strathclyde will inaugurate what is believed to be the first "summer abroad" program ever devoted specially to the study of the interaction of science, technology and society (STS). Students in the program will register at NJIT for two three-credit courses: "Technology and Society in British History" and "Mass Communications, Technology and Culture." The first of these courses will focus on the emergence of Britain as the "workshop of the world" during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, with particular attention paid to the important role of Scotland and the city of Glasgow in the industrialization process. A distinctive feature of the course will be weekly excursions led by various members of the Strathclyde history department, which was recently rated (along with Edinburgh University) in the highest category for economic and social history. A trip to Robert Owen's New Lanark, for example, will be conducted by noted authority John Butt. Other Strathclyde faculty taking part in the course include James Treble, Callum Brown, and the principal instructor, Arthur McIvor. Additional support has come from Strathclyde's new dean of arts and sciences, W. Hamish Fraser, whose book on Scottish workers in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries is reviewed in this issue. Richard Sher will serve as NJIT coordinator for the program, which is jointly sponsored at the American end by the NJIT Honors Program and the cooperative STS Program at NJIT and Rutgers-Newark.

The program runs for five weeks, from 27 June through 29 September. Despite the low value of the dollar, it is being offered at an extremely attractive price in order to establish itself in the highly competitive "summer abroad" market. There are still a few openings for this summer; interested students should call Richard Sher as soon as possible at (201) 596-3216.

Wisconsin Goes to Dalkeith

Dalkeith House, in the town of Dalkeith eight miles east of Edinburgh, a seat of the dukes of Buccleuch since the seventeenth century, has gained new occupants since the academic year 1986-87. About a hundred students and faculty from four branches of the University of Wisconsin have opened a continuing "Wisconsin-in-Scotland" program there.

The classical palace of about 210 rooms was built between 1701 and 1709 by Anne, Dowager Duchess of Buccleuch and Monmouth. The palace and the Buc-

cleuch family are identified in several ways with British aristocratic and intellectual history. Anne was a patron of Dryden and in 1712-14 employed John Gay as secretary. In 1763 Adam Smith resigned his Glasgow professorship to become tutor to the third duke of Buccleuch there. William Adam worked on the palace and built the stables; Robert Adam designed the graceful Montagu Bridge over the North Esk in the park. In the nineteenth century the palace was frequented by Sir Walter Scott, friend and distant relative of the Buccleuchs, who wrote of Anne and her ancestors in such works as *The Lay of the Last Minstrel*.

Each semester, each of four Wisconsin campuses sends 20-25 students and one faculty member to live and study in the palace. Two lecturers from the University of Edinburgh complete the faculty. A variety of courses in several disciplines are given each year, such as the interdisciplinary course on the Enlightenment (with a Scottish emphasis) that was offered in the autumn of 1986 by Noble Stockton--to whom *Eighteenth-Century Scotland* is indebted for this story.

Articles Wanted

New Journal on Fiction

A new journal, *Eighteenth Century Fiction*, will begin appearing in 1988 under the editorship of David Blewett. It is meant to provide a forum for the exchange of critical views on different aspects of fictional literature from this period. By attracting first-rate articles on fiction, the journal will attempt to become a focal point of scholarly discussion of the novel and essential reading for all scholars of the subject. All scholarly articles on imaginative prose in the period 1660-1830 are eligible. Send three copies of contributions of 6000 words or less to The Editor, *Eighteenth Century Fiction*, English Department, McMaster University, Hamilton, Ontario, Canada L8S 4L9.

Politics and the Press

A special issue of *Studies in History and Politics* is now being prepared on "Politics and the Press in Hanoverian Britain." Articles, ideally between 3000 and 5000 words long, should be submitted to either Karl Schweizer, Chair, Humanities Department, New Jersey Institute of Technology, Newark, NJ 07102 (formally of Bishop's University in Quebec) or Jeremy Black, Department of History, Durham University, Durham DH1 3HP, England.

Ernest Campbell Mossner (1907-1986): A Personal Memoir

by Ian Ross

Ernest Campbell Mossner was a true humanist who was blessed with a wonderful sense of humor. In his best achievements as a scholar, teacher, and writer, he was warmly encouraged and supported by Carolyn Walz, the remarkable woman who was his wife for fifty years. The strength of their marriage, so apparent to all who knew them, was most severely tested and affirmed in the saddest of circumstances, the death of their only son David, of the brightest promise, in 1970 in the Vietnam War. Somehow they had the resilience to continue lives of great generosity of spirit, and with Carolyn's watchful care over health that was always precarious, Ernest was able to complete his endlessly stimulating work on David Hume with a second edition of his classic biography in 1980 and two late papers in which he sought to distill the meaning he found in the great philosopher and historian's life and writings.

I encountered Ernest Mossner in print in 1955, when I read the first edition of the *Life of David Hume*. I was so excited by it that, helped by a Fulbright Travel Grant, I went to Texas to study with the author. In my decision to do this I was strongly backed by my supervisor at Oxford, David Nichol Smith, who admired Ernest's work, and by my brother Angus, who had met Ernest in Austin and liked him, and could tell me that the University of Texas Library had excellent resources for research on eighteenth-century topics. Ernest had continued the active acquisition program of the great Pope scholar, R. H. Griffith, who was his predecessor as an eighteenth-century specialist. Griffith was a formidable old fellow. Carolyn told me that at a dinner party in Austin during the time when Ernest was being interviewed for the job there, Griffith suddenly asked for her definition of the sublime. She answered by saying, in some desperation, that she hadn't thought about that for some time. I doubt this admission counted against the Mossners, and it was my impression that English Department people in Austin came to think very highly of them indeed.

My first meeting with Ernest Mossner was in September 1956, on one of the first days he was back in his office to interview graduate students after a severe attack of phlebitis. His life had been in danger, and Carolyn had taken out a realtor's license and begun a career in case she had to fend for herself and David. I do not think Ernest ever enjoyed robust health, but his spirits and intellectual vitality never seemed to be affected for the

worse. On that first occasion he interviewed me briskly and cordially, accepted me for his seminar on Hume as a man of letters, and signed a loan note with the University Co-op Bank to allow to me to survive until I got my first teaching assistant's check at the end of the month. He also invited me to his house for my first barbeque a week or so later, when I met Carolyn and David for the first time. I feel most fortunate in the interest Ernest Mossner took in me, the formative influence he had on my development as a scholar, and the steady friendship he and his family gave me. From that far-off time, I remember most vividly his hunched, stocky figure, his puckish face with a moustache under a hawk-like nose, and his clear blue eyes that looked quizzically at the world. He retained his New York accent, contrasting markedly with the Texas drawl of my new acquaintances, but he told me his mother was a Campbell, and I always thought his shrewdness and skeptical outlook bespoke Campbell blood.

Carolyn was tall, fair-haired, and blue-eyed, with a most attractive freckled complexion. From her time as a volunteer in the British forces during the second world war, she retained something of an English accent. She was always delighted by Ernest's outrageous puns, as in the following exchange when we drove past a battery hen operation: Carolyn: "I wonder what goes on in there." Ernest (nonchalantly): "Chicanery." Carolyn (as usual): "Oh, Ernest!"

David was a friendly boy, very like his mother. He was taken on research trips with his parents, meeting some very eminent people. In Edinburgh, Henry Meikle, then in charge of the National Library and Historiographer Royal of Scotland, asked David if he would like to see his seal. David was terribly disappointed when this turned out to be a coat of arms signifying his host's official position and not a living animal.

As the seminar on Hume progressed, and we pursued aspects of the composition, contents, and reception of the *Natural History of Religion* and *Dialogues Concerning Natural Religion*, I came to see how profound a sympathy Ernest had with his subject and how happy he was in his Humean researches. A first book, *Bishop Butler and the Age of Reason* (1936), had explored the fate of deism in the eighteenth century as an attempt to base religion on reason, and it brought forward Joseph Butler as the proponent of a probabilistic argument for Christian theism. Late in the book, however, David Hume emerges as the thinker whose honesty in following skepticism destroys the grounds for deism and Butler's position. In an article published in *Mind* in 1936, entitled "The Enigma of Hume," Ernest revealed the fascination

Hume exerted on him, and the later biographical work was foreshadowed. He thus became one of that distinguished group of American scholars of this century who have added immeasurably to our knowledge of the lives and, through this approach, the writings, of great British figures of the eighteenth century. One thinks of F. A. Pottle's work on Boswell, James Clifford's on Johnson, Wilmar Lewis's on Horace Walpole, George Sherburn's on Pope, and Irvin Ehrenpreis's on Swift. I hope I will not be accused of undue partiality in suggesting that Ernest Mossner's work on Hume was marked by greater affection for his subject, and perhaps informed by deeper passion about the questions concerning human nature that Hume addressed.

Affection for Hume and concern about his teachings emerge powerfully in *The Forgotten Hume: Le Bon David* (1943). Ernest told me that the ship carrying copies to Britain was torpedoed, so the book never reached a readership there and never made the impact it deserved. Ernest was given one of the first permits issued to an American scholar to do research in Britain following the war--I think this was facilitated by David Daiches, then attached to the British Embassy in Washington. The fruits of Ernest's mission could be relished by all readers of the magnificent *Life of Hume*, which was published in 1954 by Nelson of Edinburgh and University of Texas Press at Austin. The book's success seems to lie in the satisfying adjustment of the claims of serious analysis of Hume's thought as it evolved chronologically, and detailed record of Hume's career. Hume emerges as a living personality, convincingly filling the role of intellectual hero. That same year, Ernest and Raymond Klibansky of McGill University published *New Hume Letters*, presenting correspondence discovered subsequent to that published by J.Y.T. Greig in 1932. I believe these books furthered philosophical understanding of Hume. It is also my belief that they greatly stimulated interest in the Scottish Enlightenment, that many-faceted intellectual movement forming part of the background to Hume's career.

My time in Austin from 1956 to 1960 was made very agreeable by Ernest's teaching and example as a scholar. In the Rare Books Room in the ill-fated University Tower, I drowsed over the works of Lord Kames and his proteges under the eyes of Fanny Ratchford, and later took chapters of my thesis to Ernest to be discussed by him in the more bracing, because air-conditioned, surroundings of the English Department building. His criticism was pointed, but he must have liked what he read, because he asked me to help a bit with articles.

In 1964 he was invited to write the biography of Adam Smith, and he called on me to be co-editor of the correspondence, with responsibility for the letters to Smith, because we decided to publish both sides. We met in Glasgow in the summer of 1965 to launch this project and had the greatest fun hunting for letters together. We were entertained in the customs-house in Kirkcaldy by tales of smuggling days in Fife--part of the background to the great man's thoughts about free trade and revenue raising--and we splashed through the rainiest of Edinburgh streets to the Scottish Record Office to see a new Smith letter, which turned out to be a brief refusal of an invitation--Smith fearing that an "Election dinner is not the proper remedy" for pains in the stomach and side. Ernest's smile at this discovery was ironic, for he found it typical of the meager results of Smith research, when contrasted with the excitement of pursuing the ebullient Hume. I do not think he ever warmed to Adam Smith, and though he did his level best to uncover Smith material, he gave up work on him with some relief when illness of the circulatory system and eye trouble made this necessary. Of course, I was much honored by his nomination of me to continue the Smith biography project, and he most generously gave me the notes he had taken and books that would help me. To the end of his life his advice was readily forthcoming about Smith and the Hume connection. I should also add that Carolyn took part fully in discussions about Smith and was similarly encouraging to me.

In their last years, we had opportunities to meet when they took cruises to Alaska and stopped over in Vancouver to see my family, or when I visited Austin. I observed their customary kindness toward people they knew and each other, as well as the great interest they took in young people, so cheering in its example. But I also observed with great concern that they had to endure bouts of intense pain. On 22 June 1986 they celebrated with friends in Austin their fiftieth wedding anniversary, and apparently thereafter it became apparent that the pain they suffered could not be relieved. Accordingly, they made the courageous decision to end their lives on 5 August. I imagine Ernest remembered the wise words of Hume: "that Suicide may often be consistent with interest and with our duty to ourselves, no one can question, who allows that age, sickness, or misfortune, may render life a burden, and make it worse even than annihilation." Those of us who knew Carolyn and Ernest Mossner, or have benefited from the books Ernest wrote with Carolyn's help, can surely consider them among the "enlightened," in whom, as Ernest wrote, "germinate and fructify humanity and knowledge."

Reprinting the Scottish Enlightenment

by Richard B. Sher

One indication of the growing interest in eighteenth-century Scottish studies over the last twenty-five years is the expansion of the reprint trade. Yet, owing to high prices geared to library sales, low visibility at academic conferences, and a confusing "subscription" system of publication, most publishers that produce reprints of eighteenth-century Scottish books, along with reprints of classic secondary sources, do not find their natural market among students of the field. The results are sometimes tragic. A few years ago AMS Press of New York--which has reprinted important books such as Adam Ferguson's *Principles of Moral and Political Science* and James McCosh's *The Scottish Philosophy*--announced an impressive reprint series called "The Scottish Enlightenment," under the general editorship of Coleman O. Parsons. Though the titles to be reprinted looked splendid, as did the slick brochure that was issued to publicize them, the series never actually materialized. The brochure that seemed to launch the series with such decisiveness was in fact a trial balloon meant to see which way the wind was blowing. When the response to the brochure was slight, the press quietly dropped the series without ever publishing the promised titles. So it goes in the reprint business.

The German publisher Georg Olms is another example of a reprint house that operates on the subscription principle. When contacted by *Eighteenth-Century Scotland*, Olms sent a mouth-watering "Anglistica/Americana" catalogue that included literally dozens of out-of-print Scottish titles. It seemed too good to be true, and it was. After sending for information about sixty-four of the most interesting titles, I learned that only a handful of them were actually in print. To its credit, Olms is still taking subscriptions for the titles it has announced but not yet published, including such rare birds as James Balfour's *Philosophical Dissertations and Philosophical Essays*, George Cheyne's *Essay on Regimen and Philosophical Principles of Religion*, David Fordyce's *Dialogues concerning Education and Elements of Moral Philosophy*, and Tytler's life of Kames. Pre-publication subscription prices are considerably lower than post-publication ones, but there is no guarantee when--or if--the books will ever appear. For the Scottish books it has already published, Olms has kindly offered ECSSS members a 15-20 percent discount, which is doubly attractive because the new Olms catalogue will raise prices across the board. American book-lovers may find this

some consolation for the dismal exchange rate they now face.

Among the books currently available from Olms are the following: James Beattie's *Works* (consisting of the *Essays, Dissertations, and Elements of Moral Science*, which are also available separately); Thomas Blackwell, *Enquiry into the Life of Homer*; Robert Chambers, *Biographical Dictionary of Eminent Scotsmen*; Lord Kames, *Elements of Criticism, Essays on the Principles of Morality, and Sketches of the History of Man*; Colin Maclaurin, *Account of Newton's Discoveries*; Thomas Reid, *Philosophical Works*; and George Turnbull, *Principles of Moral Philosophy*. For further information about prices and availability, write to Georg Olms Verlag AG, Hagentorwall 7, D-3200 Hildesheim, W. Germany.

Garland Publishing of New York has long been a leader in reprinting eighteenth-century Scottish books. The firm has recently become a major force in the publication of other contributions to this field, including forthcoming critical bibliographies of Boswell and Burns and a multi-volume playing edition of Burns's songs--all by ECSSS members. When the people at Garland learned that *Eighteenth-Century Scotland* was planning a piece on reprinting the Scottish Enlightenment, they were happy to cooperate. For a limited time Garland is offering some of its reprints at significant savings that I am happy to bring to the attention of our readers.

From Garland's impressive philosophy list, James Beattie's two-volume *Elements of Moral Science*, one of several important moral philosophy textbooks of the Scottish Enlightenment, is a positive steal at \$35. Beattie's harsh attack on Hume, *Essay on the Nature and Immutability of Truth* (1770), is a book more written about than actually read, but at the sale price of \$15 it can now become more accessible to students and scholars. Another Aberdonian attack on Hume, George Campbell's *A Dissertation on Miracles* (1762), is less drastically reduced but still a good buy at \$30. The attack on Aberdonian common sense that Joseph Priestley published in 1774 with a long title beginning *An Examination of Dr. Reid's Inquiry* is available at \$15, while Priestley's brief critique of Hume's doctrine of natural religion, *Letters to a Philosophical Unbeliever*, is sale-priced at just \$10. Thomas Brown's *Observations on Hume's views of cause and effect* costs \$20. \$25 buys a copy of Lord Kames's *Essays on the Principles of Morality and Natural Religion*, which caused so much controversy when originally published in 1751. For \$65, more ambitious readers can own, and possibly even read, the six volumes of *Antient Metaphysics* that Lord Monboddoo gave to the world over the last twenty-one years of the

eighteenth century (the list price was \$300!). There are several classic secondary works on Hume for sale, including Norman Kemp Smith's *Philosophy of David Hume* (\$25), J.Y.T. Greig's *David Hume* (\$20), and John Hill Burton's *Life and Correspondence of David Hume* (2 volumes, \$50). A more general secondary source--H. G. Graham's *Scottish Men of Letters in the Eighteenth Century*--is an excellent buy at \$20.

In literature, Garland is offering three volumes of eighteenth-century *Scottish Ballad Operas* for \$21 each. The respective volumes are devoted to pastoral comedies, history and politics, and farce and satire, with four or five ballad operas included in each volume. *The Plays of John Home* is a handy one-volume edition of all six of Home's tragedies, plus an introduction by James S. Malek, for \$35. I am unfamiliar with Sir William Anstruther's *Essays, Moral and Divine* (1701), but Garland's catalogue bills it as a stiff-necked Scottish Presbyterian view of the stage, priced at \$22.50. Finally, fans of Henry Mackenzie can pick up a two-volume edition of *Julia de Roubigne* for just \$15. To purchase any of these sale books while quantities last, write to Garland Publishing at 136 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, USA, and refer to this sale. Terms are extremely generous: on prepaid and credit card orders, Garland will cover postage and handling, and books may be returned for full credit within thirty days for any reason.

Garland's wide range of activities includes a series of "outstanding dissertations" in Modern European History under the general editorship of William H. McNeill. In 1987 the British section of the series, edited by Peter Stansky, published two Harvard University dissertations of interest to students of eighteenth-century Scotland. One is Robert Kent Donovan's *No Popery and Radicalism: Opposition to Roman Catholic Relief in Scotland, 1778-1782*. Although nearly a quarter of a century old, this 1964 dissertation is perhaps the fullest treatment of the anti-Catholic hostilities that flared up in Scotland in 1778-79 and became the inspiration for the Gordon Riots in London in 1780. Donovan's study is steeped in primary sources and includes a valuable annotated bibliography of primary and secondary works that has been updated in a new Preface. Like the dissertation itself, some of the author's primary sources were unknown to later authors who have covered this subject--such as the author of this article. Donovan's study is useful for its integrative approach. The author wisely chooses to treat the No Popery affair within several broader contexts--the struggle between the Moderate and Popular parties in the Church of Scotland, the nature of local and national politics, and the American crisis and

the military needs it created. This approach gives greater credibility to his contention "that the crisis of 1778-1782 is best understood as the result of religious attitudes and concerns and that attempts to reduce them to something more 'fundamental' are not very useful or enlightening."

Stephen Conrad's 1980 dissertation, *Citizenship and Common Sense: The Problem of Authority in the Social Background and Social Philosophy of the Wise Club of Aberdeen*, is likewise the fullest treatment of its subject in print. Some readers may take issue with the author's attempts in the early chapters of the study to place the Wise Club (or Philosophical Society in Aberdeen, as it was formally named) within the general context of an ongoing crisis of authority in the Northeast dating back to the sixteenth century: one wonders if more attention to the international proliferation of scientific and learned societies would not have served the topic better. But once the author begins to deal with the Wise Club itself, using a large number of previously unexplored manuscripts, the importance of this work becomes clear. Conrad shows that the motivating force behind the Wise Club's scientific and philosophical investigations--including the famous attacks on Hume's skepticism by common sense philosophers such as Beattie, Campbell, and Reid--was a desire to bring about moral and social improvement. The Wise Club, then, was very much a part of the Scottish Enlightenment, even though it represented an approach quite different from the one associated with eighteenth-century Scotland's greatest philosopher.

Though both these works are unquestionably important contributions to the study of eighteenth-century Scotland, one may question their format. Each looks and reads like a typed thesis rather than a book, and the addition of new prefaces cannot take the place of substantive revisions. At the very least these works should have been touched up to take into account more recent research and then reprinted using a desktop publisher and laser printer--an inexpensive process that would have more than paid for itself by greatly increasing the number of words on the printed page. At \$60-\$75 per volume, the current format makes no sense.

Another of the premier reprint publishers of eighteenth-century Scottish books is Augustus M. Kelley. Kelley's bindings are far more attractive than the library-like Garland ones, and all the titles listed in their catalogue have actually been published. When contacted, Kelley was quite willing to offer its Scottish books at special sale prices meant only for ECSSS members--generally 33 percent or more off list. The strong point of the Kelley list lies in political economy and related fields.

James Anderson's *Observations on the Means of Exciting a Spirit of National Industry* is a large and splendid volume, published the year after the *Wealth of Nations*. ECSSS members can purchase it for \$30. Kelley sale books that relate to Adam Smith specifically include William Robert Scott's *Adam Smith as Student and Professor* (1937, \$25), the James Bonar and Tadao Yanahaira editions of Smith's library (1932, \$12.50 and 1951, \$25, respectively), James Buchanan's *Observations on the Wealth of Nations* (1817, \$25), and the second edition of Dugald Stewart's valuable *Biographical Memoirs of Adam Smith, William Robertson and Thomas Reid* (1858, \$25). Stewart's two-volume *Lectures on Political Economy* was in too short supply to be included in this sale, though a limited number of copies may still be available at the list price of \$75. For the history of Scottish economics and technology generally, consider the following secondary works: *Scottish Economic Literature to 1800* by William Robert Scott (1911, \$12.50); *Studies in Scottish Business History*, Peter L. Payne's 1967 collection that includes several useful essays on the eighteenth century (\$25), and John Butt et al., *Industrial History in Pictures: Scotland* (1968, \$12.50), though most of the illustrations in the last of these books date from the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Samuel Smiles, *Lives of the Engineers* (3 vols., 1861-62, \$67.50 the set) is a major source for understanding both eighteenth-century engineering and the ways in which it served to buttress the Victorian concept of "self-help." Note how Smiles uses Scotland's poverty and backwardness as the backdrop for his discussions in volume two of the Scottish engineers John Rennie and Thomas Telford, who emerge as technological heroes who helped to make economic progress possible.

One eighteenth-century Scottish author whose writings touched upon, but greatly transcended, economic issues is particularly well represented in the Kelley-ECSSS sale list. Robert Wallace published his first book, *A Dissertation on the Numbers of Mankind*, in 1753 to dispute David Hume's claims for the superior population--and by extension, morality--of the modern, as against the ancient, world. Kelley is offering a reprint of the second edition (1809) for \$25. Wallace's second book, *Characteristics of the Present Political State of Great Britain*, was meant to show that British moral corruption and economic decline had not gone as far as some writers were contending during the 1750s. ECSSS members can purchase the second edition (1758) for just \$15. The third and perhaps most interesting of Wallace's books, *Various Prospects of Mankind, Nature and Providence* (\$25), attracted little attention when first published in

1761 but later gained fame for prefiguring Malthus's pessimistic argument about overpopulation posing a threat to the perfectability of man. Most careful readers of the book, however, will be more taken by the strong radical Whig component in Wallace, who had many positive things to say about utopia before finally concluding that such a thing could never work in practice.

Francis Hutcheson was already seven years dead when Wallace (who was just three years his junior) published his first book in 1753, yet one of Hutcheson's most important works appeared posthumously in the middle of that decade. This was the two-volume *System of Moral Philosophy*, with a valuable biographical sketch by William Leechman. It was a great disappointment to learn that Kelley's splendid, reasonably priced facsimile reprint of the *System*, replete with the original subscription list, is now out of stock and may not be reprinted. Perhaps if enough ECSSS members tell the publisher of their interest in purchasing the *System*, another printing will soon occur. In the meantime, those with an interest in Hutcheson may purchase William Robert Scott's classic biography, *Francis Hutcheson* (1900), for just \$19.50. Hutcheson also appears as one of the primary subjects of Gladys Bryson's important book *Man and Society: The Scottish Inquiry of the Eighteenth Century* (1945, \$19.50), which no one interested in the moral philosophy and social science of the Scottish Enlightenment should be without.

Finally, Kelley is offering two reprint titles that throw light on the turbulent 1790s. Henry Cockburn's *Whiggish Examination of the Trials for Sedition . . . in Scotland* (1888) is available in a two-volumes-in-one edition for \$35. Also available is Henry W. Meikle, *Scotland and the French Revolution* (1912, \$25), which is after all these years still the standard work on its subject.

Readers should note that the sale prices cited above are valid only for ECSSS members and only until 31 August 1988. All orders must be prepaid in U.S. dollars, and all sales are final except in the event of damage or error. Shipping charges are additional: add \$1.50 (\$2.00 outside U.S.) for the first book and \$.75 (\$1.00 outside U.S.) for each additional book. The Smiles set counts as three books for shipping purposes. Send orders and payments to: A. M. Kelley Publishers, 1140 Broadway, Room 901, New York, NY 10001, USA.

Kelley's catalogue lists an expensive reprint of the 1776 edition of the *Wealth of Nations*, but the publication of cheap editions of the definitive six-volume Glasgow Edition of the Works and Correspondence of Adam Smith has rendered this and all other reprints of Smith's works all but obsolete. **Liberty Press** is selling handsome

paperback editions of these justly acclaimed volumes at the remarkable price of \$5.50 each--including postage. (Liberty is also offering an equally handsome six-volume paperback version of the 1778 edition of David Hume's *History of England* for \$7.50 a volume, as well as an excellent reprint of the 1777 edition of Hume's *Essays*, edited by Eugene F. Miller, for \$8.50). That means all 1080 pages in both volumes of Campbell, Skinner, and Todd's fine edition of the *Wealth of Nations* can be had for just \$11, while the single volumes of the *Essays on Philosophical Subjects* (which includes Dugald Stewart's life of Smith), *Theory of Moral Sentiments*, *Lectures on Jurisprudence*, and *Lectures on Rhetoric and Belles Lettres* are each available for half that amount. Still to come in paperback is the volume of Smith's correspondence edited by E. C. Mossner and I. S. Ross. Originally published by Oxford University Press in the 1970s, the *Correspondence of Adam Smith* was republished in 1987 in a second edition that corrected many errors and added several newly discovered letters. Those who can neither afford the costly Oxford edition of the *Correspondence* nor wait for the inexpensive Liberty edition can purchase a remaindered copy of the first (hardback) edition for \$19.95 from **Laissez Faire Books**, which also sells Liberty's paperback editions of Smith's works (\$5.50 per volume, but shipping is extra), the Kelley reprint of Bonar's *Catalogue of the Library of Adam Smith* (\$12.50), and from time to time other Kelley reprints of Scottish books at sale prices. To order books mentioned in this paragraph, write to: Liberty Press/Liberty Classics, 7440 North Shadeland, Indianapolis, IN 46250, USA, or Laissez Faire Books, 532 Broadway, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10012-3956.

Some ECSSS members may take offense at the fact that Liberty Press and Laissez Faire Books publish titles that reflect the ideological viewpoint of their parent organizations (the Liberty Fund and the Libertarian Review Foundation, respectively). Indeed, one wonders how comfortable Hume and Smith themselves would be if they somehow learned of their deification at the hands of twentieth-century American capitalists. A more extreme example of the ideological uses of Scottish Enlightenment reprints concerns *Proofs of a Conspiracy against All the Religions and Governments of Europe* (1797), by the Edinburgh University professor of natural philosophy, John Robison. Upon learning that a press called **Western Islands** (Belmont, MA 02178) was selling a cheap paperback edition of this rare work--which blames the French Revolution on Continental philosophers, freemasons, and illuminati--I promptly sent off for a copy. What came back was more than I had

expected--not merely an apparently faithful modern version of the fourth edition (1798) of Robison's reactionary volume but a new, anonymous introduction drawing parallels in italicized type between the eighteenth-century illuminati and modern communists. I soon discovered that Western Islands is an arm of the right-wing John Birch Society, which has republished Robison's book "to illustrate how a conspiracy of intellectuals" could get started and develop. It is at least reassuring to know that the Scottish Enlightenment is still considered relevant in the modern world!

Returning to reputable scholarly publishers, one that deserves mention for reprinting Scottish Enlightenment books is **Southern Illinois University Press** (P.O. Box 3697, Carbondale, IL 62902-3697). In the 1960s SIU Press brought out an excellent series of reprints in the history of rhetoric that included two Scottish classics--Hugh Blair's *Lectures on Rhetoric and Belles Lettres* (1783) and George Campbell's *The Philosophy of Rhetoric* (1776)--as well as *Lectures on Elocution* by Thomas Sheridan, an Irishman who went to Edinburgh to teach the Scots proper speech. In time the series was allowed to lapse, but now it seems to be coming back. SIU Press will soon publish a selection of John Witherpsoon's writings--including his lectures on eloquence--under the editorship of ECSSS member Thomas Miller. And shortly before press time I received from SIU Press a copy of a new edition of George Campbell's *Philosophy of Rhetoric*, with a revised introduction by the editor, Lloyd F. Bitzer. What's more, it was a paperback priced to sell briskly at just \$15.95 (it's also available in hard cover for a reasonable \$29.95). One hopes that an updated, reasonably priced edition of Blair's *Lectures* will soon appear as well.

Members on the Move

John Price has retired from the English Department at Edinburgh University and moved to London, though he hopes to continue to be affiliated with EU as a fellow. . . . **Arthur Donovan** has resigned his appointment at VPI to become head of the Humanities Department at the U.S. Merchant Marine Academy. . . . **Leah Leneman** is now a fellow at St. Andrews University. . . . **David Daiches** spent this academic year at the National Humanities Center in North Carolina. . . . **Tom Miller** has left the English Department at Southern Illinois University for the sunnier climate at University of Arizona. . . . After a stint as acting chair of the English Department at Texas Tech University, **Jeff Smitten** has been appointed to that

post on a permanent basis. . . . Congratulations to Tom Devine, who has been named to a personal history chair at Strathclyde University. . . . ECSSS member-at-large Susan Purviance has moved from Indiana University of Pennsylvania to University of Toledo. . . . After spending the year at Stanford University as a Mellon Postdoctoral Fellow in the Humanities, Leigh Eric Schmidt will take a regular faculty position in the Religious Studies Department at University of Oregon. . . . John Ashmead has retired from the English Department at Haverford College, giving him more time to finish the multi-volume edition of the *Songs of Robert Burns* that he is putting together with John Davison. . . . In the autumn of 1988 Bruce Lenman will become the James Pinkney Harrison Visiting Professor at the College of William and Mary. . . . Thomas Richardson has moved to the English Department at North Carolina State. . . . Jim Basker is now on the English faculty at Barnard College. . . . Hamish Fraser is the new dean of arts and sciences at Strathclyde University.

ECSSS members--send us information about your comings and goings for publication in this column.

Announcements

Reinagle Tunes Offered

Anne McClenny Krauss has edited, with Maurice Hinson, Scottish music for piano or harpsichord by the eighteenth-century composer Alexander Reinagle: *Six Scots Tunes with Variations for Keyboard* (\$3.00) and *Five Scots Tunes with Variations for Keyboard* (\$4.95). To order, contact Hinshaw Music, Inc., P.O. Box 470, Chapel Hill, NC 27514.

German Scottish Studies Centre Active

Under the directorship of Horst Drescher, the Scottish Studies Centre at the University of Mainz is keeping Scottish studies alive in Germany. The newsletter published by the Centre is free: simply indicate your interest in a letter to the Scottish Studies Centre, F.A.S., D-6728 Germersheim, Fed. Republic of Germany.

New Social History to Appear

John Donald Publishers of Edinburgh, in association with the Economic and Social History Society of Scotland, has announced "one of the most exciting Scottish publishing ventures for many years"--the three-volume *People and Society in Scotland*. This social history of Scotland since the mid-eighteenth century will appear in

paperback in a format designed to have wide appeal to students and non-specialists.

The first volume of the work, covering the period 1760-1830, is due to appear this summer under the editorship of T. M. Devine and Rosalind Mitchison. As a special pre-publication offer, John Donald is making this volume available for eight pounds instead of ten--a 20 percent discount. For further information, contact John Donald at 138 St. Stephen Street, Edinburgh EH3 5AA, Scotland.

Sale Books from Columbia

Through 31 August 1988, Columbia University Press is offering several books of interest at substantial discounts. William R. Brock, *Scotus Americanus: A Study of Eighteenth-Century Sources*, and Peter Jones, *Hume's Sentiments: Their Ciceronian and French Context*, are available at \$12.50 each. Both are published in Britain by Edinburgh University Press. A more recent EUP book, David Daiches et al., *A Hotbed of Genius: The Scottish Enlightenment, 1730-1790*, is not part of the sale but is available from Columbia U.P. for just \$16 in paper and \$32 in cloth. An original Columbia University Press book that places Scottish scientific societies in an international context--James E. McClellan III, *Science Reorganized: Scientific Societies in the Eighteenth Century*--is on sale for \$22.50. To order, write Columbia University Press, 136 South Broadway, Irvington, NY 10533 (offer may not apply outside North America).

Scotland and America Volume in Progress

Richard Sher and Jeffrey Smitten have signed a contract with Edinburgh University Press to edit the first ECSSS-sponsored collection of essays, now titled *Scotland and America in the Age of the Enlightenment*. North American co-publication will be handled by Princeton University Press, and all royalties from the book will go to ECSSS. More details about this volume will appear in next spring's issue of *Eighteenth-Century Scotland*.

Eighteenth-Century Lecturership

Bath College of Higher Education has announced an opening for a lecturer in history for autumn 1988, with opportunities to teach a first-year English social history course as well as a new second-level course on the Enlightenment in England, Scotland and France. Contact Brian L. Gomes da Costa, Director, Bath College of Higher Education, Newton Park, Newton St. Loe, Bath BA2 9BN, England.

**The Scottish Enlightenment:
A Supplementary Bibliography of Doctoral Dissertations, 1965-1987**

by

Paul J. deGategno
Department of English
North Carolina Wesleyan College
Rocky Mount, NC 27804

This bibliography supplements the original listing published in the first issue of *Eighteenth-Century Scotland*. I am grateful to the many readers who alerted me to their dissertations, as well as to those of their colleagues. In the hopes of future supplements, I invite readers to report to me omissions and further corrections to this bibliography.

- Ammon, T. G. "The Philosophical Importance of the Dialogue Form: An Analysis of Plato's 'Phaedrus' and Hume's 'Dialogues'" Washington U., 1985
- Barrie, A.I.F. "Monboddo on Poetry: Critical Edition of Poetry by James Burnett, Lord Monboddo" Edinburgh U., 1980
- Baskin, W. C. "Personal Identity in Hume's Enlightenment Science of Man" New School for Social Research, 1980
- Battersby, C. "Hume's Easy Philosophy: Ease and Inertia in Hume's Newtonian Science of Man" Sussex U., 1978
- Bellringer, A. W. "An Edition of Thomas Reid's Lectures on the Fine Arts" Aberdeen U., 1968
- Bishop, J. D. "The Moral Philosophy of Francis Hutcheson" Edinburgh U., 1977
- Bradbury, M. L. "Adventure in Persuasion" (ref: John Witherspoon) Harvard U., 1967
- Bristol, J.R.M. "The Nature and Function of the Moral Sense in the Ethical Philosophies of Shaftesbury and Hutcheson" U. of Toronto, 1970
- Bysveen, J. "Epic Tradition and Innovation in James Macpherson's Fingal" Uppsala U., 1980
- Carr-Wiggin, R. W. "Hume's Philosophy of History" Guelph U., 1981
- Cheever, L. A. "The Good Life: The Development of a Concept in Smollett's Novels" U. of Southern California, 1971
- Cloyd, E. L. "James Burnett, Lord Monboddo, 1714-1799" Columbia U., 1967
- Devakul, N. "Shaftesbury, Hutcheson, and Hume on the Theory of Taste" Boston Coll., 1982
- Douglass, W. J. "Smollett and the Sordid Knaves: Political Satire in the Adventures of an Atom" U. of Florida, 1976
- Fabel, R.F.A. "Governor George Johnstone, 1730-1787" Auburn U., 1974
- Freeman, F. W. "Eighteenth-Century Scottish Humanism and the Poetry of Robert Fergusson" Edinburgh U., 1982
- Frick, J. P. "The Cosmological Argument and the Problem of Causation in Hume, Kant, and Ewing" Southern Baptist Theol. Sem., 1983
- Galbraith, W. H. "James Hutton: An Analytic and Historical Study" U. of Pittsburgh, 1974
- Gallagher, C. T. "A Scottish Contribution to American Higher Education: The Saint Andrew's Society of New York, 1756-1806, and the Founding of King's College" U. of Kentucky, 1984
- Gilardino, S. M. "Melchiorre Cesarotti: E . . . Le Traduzioni Di Ossian" Harvard U., 1977
- Giuffre, G. A. "Tobias Smollett, William Hogarth and the Art of Caricature" Oxford U., 1979
- Glaister, R.T.D. "Education in the Presbytery of Jedburgh in the Eighteenth Century" Open U., 1984
- Grindell, R. M. "Henry Mackenzie: A Study in Literary Sentimentalism" U. of Arizona, 1972
- Haakonssen, K. "Natural Justice: The Development of a Critical Philosophy of Law from David Hume and Adam Smith to John Millar and John Craig" Edinburgh U., 1978
- Hill, J. M. "Continuity in Celtic Warfare: Strategy, Tactics, and Logistics of the Highland Scots and Irish, 1595-1763" U. of Alabama, 1985
- Hubbard, M. P. "Boswell in the Nineteenth Century: A Study of His Reputation in Britain, 1795-1900" Kansas State U., 1973
- Idoniboye, D. E. "Hume's Conception of Moral Obligation" U. of Exeter, 1974
- Jablecki, L. T. "A Study of David Hume's Treatment of Natural Law" Manchester U., 1976
- Jacob, P. E. "British Bards and the Identity of Genius, 1730-1774: Stephen Duck, James Beattie and Critical Primitivism" U. of Toronto, 1984
- Jacobson, A. M. "Causality: A Discussion of the Analysis of this Notion, with Some Criticism of the Humean Account" Oxford U., 1974
- Jemiely, T. "Philosophy as Art: A Study of the Intellectual Background of Samuel Johnson's Journey to the Western Islands of Scotland" Cornell U., 1965

- Jordan, J. N. "Hume's Account of the Conception of Physical Objects" U. of Texas, 1966
- Kapaun, G. E. "The Role of Fictive Readers in the Epistolary Novel of the Eighteenth Century" (Ref: Smollett) U. of California, Los Angeles, 1985
- Kennedy, T. D. "God and the Grounds of Morality: The Eighteenth-Century British Debate" (Ref: Reid, Hutcheson, Archibald Campbell) U. of Virginia, 1986
- Kim, H.-M. "Constant Conjunction and Necessity: A Study in Hume's Theory of Causation" Indiana U., 1982
- King, C. "Philosophy and Science in the Arts Curriculum of the Scottish Universities in the Seventeenth Century" (Ref: Scottish Enlightenment) Edinburgh U., 1982
- Lane, S. A. "The Origin of Physical Laws: Is the Humean Mode of Inference a Logical Possibility?" U. of Sheffield, 1977
- Larson, D. M. "The Man of Feeling in America: A Study of Major Early American Writers' Attitudes Toward Benevolent Ethics and Behavior" (Ref: Henry Mackenzie) U. of Minnesota, 1973
- Lawrence, P. D. "The Gregory Family: A Biographical and Bibliographical Study" Aberdeen U., 1971
- McGowan, I. D. "The Making of Boswell's The Journal of a Tour to the Hebrides, 1773-1786" U. of Stirling, 1981
- McManmon, J. J. "Francis Hutcheson, An Inquiry into the Origin of Our Ideas of Beauty and Virtue . . . Critical Edition" U. of Chicago, 1965
- Menneteau, P. "La poesie de Robert Fergusson: reflet des enjeux ideologiques de l'Ecosse du XVIIIe siecle" Sorbonne U., 1982
- Null, L. J. "Boswell's Concept of Liberty in the Era of the American Revolution" U. of Tennessee, 1977
- Passler, D. L. "Time, Form and Style in Boswell's Life of Samuel Johnson" U. of North Carolina, 1968
- Purviance, S. M. "The Delights of Humanity: Moral Perception, Reason, and Feeling in Francis Hutcheson's Moral Sense Theory" U. of California, Santa Barbara, 1987
- Reisman, J. A. "The Origins of American Political Economy, 1690-1781" Brown U., 1983
- Rosenblum, M. "Smollett and the Art of Satire" U. of Chicago, 1971
- Rosner, L. "Students and Apprentices: Medical Education at Edinburgh University, 1760-1810" Johns Hopkins U., 1986
- Ross, I. C. "The View of Eighteenth-Century Society in the Novels of Tobias Smollett" Edinburgh U., 1975
- Rymer, M. F. "Novelists of the Later Eighteenth Century: A Study of the Fiction of Henry Mackenzie, in the Period 1760-1790" Australian National U., 1973
- Sillman, M.R.S. "The Antithesis of Nature and Arts in Eighteenth-Century Literary Criticism, 1740-1790" (ref: James Beattie), U. of Michigan, 1971
- Silvester, R. A. "An Edition . . . of the Poems of Smollett" London U., 1977
- Stafford, F. J. "The Sublime Savage: A Study of James Macpherson and the Poems of Ossian in Relation to the Cultural Context of Scotland in the 1750s and 1760s" Oxford U., 1986
- Symonds, D. A. "The Re-forming of Women's Work and Culture: Scotland, 1750-1830" State University of New York, Binghamton, 1985
- Syndergaard, L. E. "English-Scottish and Danish Popular Ballads: A Comparative Study" U. of Wisconsin, 1970
- Tobin, T. A. "Scots Abroad: A Consideration of Selected Plays by Scottish Dramatists, Concentrating on Drama which Appeared in London, 1660-1800" U. of Loyola, Chicago, 1967
- Traiger, S. P. "Hume's Theory of the Self" U. of Pittsburgh, 1984
- Twomey, R. "Jacobins and Jeffersonians: Anglo-American Radicalism in the United States, 1790-1820" (ref: Scottish radicals) Northern Illinois U., 1974
- Ulman, H. L. "Thought and Language in George Campbell's The Philosophy of Rhetoric" Pennsylvania State U., 1985
- Weiss, J. M. "Patterns of Residential Mobility in Edinburgh, 1775-1800" U. of Minnesota, 1985
- Westerkamp, M. J. "Triumph of the Laity: The Migration of Revivalism from Scotland and Ireland to the Middle Colonies, 1625-1760" U. of Pennsylvania, 1984
- Wilson, G. S. "The Verse-Epistles of Robert Burns: A Critical Study" Stirling U., 1977
- Zeigler, J. F. "The Didactic Character of David Hume's Philosophy of Religion" U. of Georgia, 1986

* Denotes a dissertation that has been, or is about to be, published, often in radically revised form.

On the Continuing Sorrows of

"Ossian" Macpherson

by

Howard Gaskill

Dept. of German, University of Edinburgh

It is only a year ago that our ECSSS Secretary was commending the beautifully produced volume *A Hotbed of Genius: The Scottish Enlightenment* for the care and attention which had gone into it. Nor would I wish to dissent from that judgment. My enjoyment of it was not marred by being informed that Macpherson's *Fragments* appeared in 1762, or that Hugh Blair's *Critical Dissertation on the Poems of Ossian* had strangely metamorphosed into one on the *AEra of Ossian* (in fact, James Macpherson had the temerity to claim this for himself). It seems that perhaps a line or two are missing here. Such errors are relatively trifling. Nevertheless, it is sad that one has come to expect them. For a lesson that ought quickly to be learned by anyone concerning himself with Macpherson's work is that nothing connected with it should be taken on trust.

If Macpherson himself is unreliable, he seems to have the uncanny knack of insinuating his duplicity into much of the secondary literature in which he is featured. A pattern of persistent error has been allowed to develop which unfortunately shows no signs of abating. In some instances the inaccuracies are innocent enough, occasionally even unavoidable. If one finds oneself having to discuss *Ossian* in connection with literatures one doesn't know, written in languages one can't read, then one has little choice but to trust the authority of those who can (though that is not sufficient excuse for taking over second-hand value judgments).

Even here certain elementary precautions may reasonably be expected. For instance, the popular notion that Cesarotti translated *Temora* (the complete epic) in 1763 might be dispelled by the simple expedient of locating the relevant edition and actually opening it.¹ Similarly, the fact that a German critic at the beginning of the century lied about the English *Ossian* he was using does not really exculpate those who continue to repeat his assertions about all the liberties Cesarotti is supposed to have taken with a text he never translated.² The unwillingness of so many to take on board the fact that Macpherson extensively revised his Ossianic poetry in 1773 (thereby producing an English version which a fair number of Continentals did not like and refused to translate) is somewhat tiresome.³ If one wishes to guard against the trap of using a foreign translation to measure the extent to which Macpherson deviates from himself, then the best way is to arm oneself with the right edition--and read it.

Admittedly, reading *Ossian* appears to be the last thing most of us are prepared to do. This is not usually a matter of laziness. In most cases it has much more to do with a profound sense of distaste, even revulsion, toward Macpherson himself and all he stands for. Quite what the progenitor of *Ossian* can have done to deserve having so much venom and vitriol expended on him is something of a mystery, particularly when one considers that those who dispense it most liberally often tend to know little and care less about the Gaelic culture which Macpherson may be presumed to have betrayed. For it is not now the Celtic scholars who pillory him. It is instructive to compare the measured tones of Derick Thomson's work with the vituperations of a Hugh Trevor-Roper.⁴ But then Thomson can read Gaelic and has read Macpherson. Would that the same could be said of those who are so ready to give vent to ludicrously misplaced moral outrage, oozing contempt for the man and his poetry. Whether or not they were ever justified, such reactions serve little purpose now. Above all they should not excuse ignorance, distortion, suppression, and generally shoddy scholarship.

Recent years have seen signs of a tentative reawakening of interest in *Ossian*, though as yet precious few critics have been able to forget the controversy and take the work seriously as literature.⁵ But anyone imagining that the trend might be going in the direction of a more dispassionate judgment of Macpherson, perhaps even of some limited rehabilitation, will be rudely disabused by some of the contributions to the recently published volume, *Aberdeen and the Enlightenment*.⁶ Whilst it is good to see no fewer than five essays devoted to *Ossian* (loosely defined), it is distressing to have to note in⁷ at least two of them the same snide, sneering tones toward the subject matter which disfigure so much criticism. George McElroy, to be true, is concerned only with Macpherson's

historical and political writings (in relation to India) and has much to say of unsavoury intrigues and machinations, which is fair enough; what irritates is the quite gratuitous barbs designed to belittle by insinuation. I think particularly of the sarcastic asides involving the word "epic". As if it followed that, to paraphrase Johnson-Shaw: Macpherson is weak, Macpherson is wicked, therefore *Fingal* can safely be rubbished as a literary achievement.

Johnson's relationship with William Shaw and his role in the sharpening up of the latter's polemic against Macpherson is in fact the subject of Thomas M. Curley's essay. The reproduction in facsimile of the Appendix to the second edition of Shaw's *Enquiry* is very welcome, and predisposes one to forgive Curley's own *parti pris*. However, taking Johnson's side against Macpherson is one thing, manipulating or overlooking evidence, and committing errors in order to do it, is quite another. It is true that Curley has read Thomson. This does not, however, prevent his essay from bristling with inaccuracies and false emphases of which only a few may be listed here. It is quite simply false to claim that Macpherson was the first to combine two distinct ballad traditions about Cuchullin and Finn (p. 377). Macpherson did indeed boast of his manuscript finds (he was an extremely effective collector, as the holdings of the National Library of Scotland testify), but he is usually careful never to suggest that more than a small part of his own Ossianic poetry was derived from manuscript sources (see especially Blair's Preface to the *Fragments*, the 1765 Preface to *Fingal*, and even the challenge thrown out to Johnson via McNicol in 1779 to inspect manuscripts containing *some* of the poems of Ossian). Johnson's obsession with manuscripts may well have come about as a result of injudicious claims by Macpherson, but it is misleading to paraphrase him as suggesting that "Macpherson should have appealed to oral tradition as the groundwork of his poems" (p. 385), for that is exactly what Macpherson did. What Johnson says is that he should have stuck to that if he wanted to keep the deception going.

The fact is that at least two of Macpherson's manuscripts did contain Ossianic poetry (some of which was seen by Shaw, despite Curley's assertion to the contrary on page 378); these were the Little Book of Clanranald (for whose later mutilation he was not responsible), and his prize find, the Book of the Dean of Lismore. Of the latter we are told by Curley that this was "perhaps what Macpherson palmed off as his alleged Gaelic source for *Fingal*, which he characterised as being written in Saxon (actually a peculiar Irish) script" (p. 379). In the first place, by "Saxon" Macpherson, like many of his contemporaries, would have meant Gaelic *corr-litir*, and in the second, he could not have been referring to the Book of the Dean, since that is not written in any kind of Irish script, but in conventional secretary-hand, and it is only the spelling which is "peculiar." Nor is it likely (*pace* Derick Thomson) that this was what was exhibited at Becket's shop in 1762. Becket does not say that Macpherson deposited ancient Gaelic manuscripts with him; he refers to the "originals of *Fingal*," and anyone who cares to open *Temora* will find Macpherson in 1763 claiming to have left "a copy of the originals," in other words transcripts in his own fair hand. It is Macpherson, not Shaw, who first, and indeed repeatedly, speaks (albeit disparagingly) of the Ossianic ballads as fifteenth-century productions, and that is indeed when most of them began to assume the form in which we now know them. Yet here Shaw, who merely takes over the dating, is credited with having discovered this (p. 379). On page 381 Curley tells us that in Shaw's *An Analysis of the Galic Language* "*Fingal* is even plundered for grammatical illustrations of the language!" In fact, "Malvina's Dream" is used to illustrate Gaelic prosody because, as Shaw himself puts it, "these lines have beauties which the translation, notwithstanding its excellence, has not been able to display." (But, of course, here again nothing which would allow Macpherson competence in anything, except perhaps lying, may be admitted.)

It is all very well to say that the focus of criticism in Shaw's *Enquiry* "eventually shifts from Macpherson to his chief supporters, beginning with Hugh Blair, whom Johnson had already judged to be a victim of both Macpherson's duplicity and nationalistic self-deception" (p. 385). Blair, the gullible dupe, is a familiar enough figure. But it is very curious that we are not told how Shaw gives credence to rumors that *Ossian* is in fact a "promiscuous production" of Blair's and Macpherson's. Still more curious is the treatment of the Percy episode. We are indeed told on page 388 of a "Scottish attempt to deceive Thomas Percy," and on the same page there is a reference to the Appendix's containing "eight more pages of correspondence bearing on Thomas Percy's part in the controversy" (not reproduced here). What we are not told is who is supposed to have been trying to pull the wool over Percy's eyes, or who the correspondence is from. As Curley knows, but his reader at this stage cannot, the culprits implicated here are none other than Adam Ferguson and Hugh Blair himself. Admittedly, Curley is later obliged to mention this in a scarcely conspicuous footnote to the facsimile of the Appendix (which again stresses Johnson's belief in Blair's innocence).

One is forced to ask why this episode, which is after all of more than marginal importance to the controversy as argued in the *Enquiry* and Shaw-Johnson's Appendix, is glossed over in the main body of the text. If Hugh Blair,

under whose "eye" Macpherson translated *Fingal*, and Adam Ferguson, a Gaelic-speaker who perused Macpherson's materials, were involved with *Ossian* in a capacity which went appreciably beyond that of midwives, perhaps we ought to be told. But then this would not fit the accepted image. It would muddy the picture. As it is we can be presented with clear-cut divisions between goodies and baddies. On the one hand we have Shaw himself, "truth-seeking" Johnson and "honest" Thomas Percy, together with the likes of foolish, gullible, but innocent Blair. On the other we have the unspeakable Ossian-Macpherson, surrounded by his unscrupulous mafia, this being composed in the main of little names (unlike Ferguson's) about which one may be gratuitously rude: the worthy McNicol is the "author of a scurrilous book"; John Mackenzie is Macpherson's "henchman"; and, on the extremely dubious authority of Snyder, a Gaelic scholar of the quality of John Smith is lumped together with a disreputable figure like the "oily" John Clark. (The continued neglect of Smith, whose impact in France, Italy, Spain and South America rivalled that of Macpherson himself, is one of the scandals of Ossianic criticism.)

Surely we should by now have outgrown the need to pin silly labels on people in this way. Can we not accept that it is not a matter of black and white, but shades of grey; that, devious though he was, Macpherson was to a degree really being unjustly maligned; that it was possible to be right about him for the wrong reasons; that it was equally possible to be wrong about him for the right ones; that some of his most ardent supporters were perfectly genuine in their beliefs, and that some of his fiercest opponents were themselves forgers and fabricators (think of Pinkerton, and even, no doubt inspired by the purest of motives, Bishop Percy himself)--is this asking too much of scholars?

Notes

1. See P. Van Tieghem, *Le Preromantisme* (Paris, 1924): 227; Karl Weitnauer, "Ossian in der italienischen Litteratur bis etwa 1832, vorwiegend bei Monti," *Zeitschrift fuer vergleichende Litteraturgeschichte*, NF 16 (1906): 251-322, 256; Q.W.J. Daas, *De Gezangen van Ossian in Nederland* (Nijmegen, 1961), 21. In 1763 Cesarotti translated of *Temora* only what appeared in Macpherson's *Fingal* volume, that is, a single book. The complete translations did not appear until January 1773 (dated 1772).

2. See Weitnauer, 259ff., where he lists the first editions in his bibliography, but in fact quotes from the Tauchnitz, which is based on Macpherson's English of 1773. His comments on Cesarotti's "bold interpolations," etc., are taken over uncritically by Astrid Grewe, "Ossian und seine europaische Wirkung," *Europaische Romantik*, vol. II, edited by Klaus Hartmann (Wiesbaden, 1982): 171-88, 176. For more reliable information about Cesarotti, see Sergio Maria Gilardino, *La scuola romantica: la tradizione ossianica nella poesia dell' Alfieri, del Foscolo e del Leopardi* (Ravenna, 1982): 57ff.

3. For examples, see E. Alison Peers, "The Influence of Ossian in Spain," *Philological Quarterly*, 4 (1925): 121-38, 126; also the appendix to Goethe's Ossianic translations in E. L. Stahl's Blackwell edition of *Werther*, first published in 1942 and still in print.

4. See Derick S. Thomson, *The Gaelic Sources of Macpherson's "Ossian"* (Edinburgh, 1952); also "'Ossian' Macpherson and the Gaelic World of the Eighteenth Century," *Aberdeen University Review*, 60 (1963): 7-20; and Hugh Trevor-Roper, "The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland," in *The Invention of Tradition*, ed. Eric Hobsbawm (Cambridge, 1983): 15-41, 16ff; also "The Ossian Forgeries: Wrong but Romantic," *The Spectator* (16 March 1985): 14-15.

5. An honorable exception in recent years has been Josef Bysveen; see especially his *Epic Tradition and Innovation in James Macpherson's "Fingal"* (Uppsala, 1982).

6. Edited by Jennifer J. Carter and Joan H. Pittock (Aberdeen, 1987).

7. George McElroy, "Ossianic Imagination and the History of India: James and John Macpherson as Propagandists and Intriguers," 363-74; Thomas M. Curley, "Johnson's Last Word on Ossian: Ghostwriting for William Shaw," 375-431.

Howard Gaskill is currently editing a volume of essays on James Macpherson and the poetry of Ossian for ECSSS. He would like it to be known that ideas for additional contributions will still be considered. Literary treatments and examinations of hitherto neglected areas of reception will be particularly welcome.

Book Reviews

Jennifer J. Carter and Joan H. Pittock, eds. *Aberdeen and the Enlightenment: Proceedings of A Conference Held at the University of Aberdeen*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press, 1987. Pp. x + 438.

This volume is handsome, and generous--arguably to a fault. It collects, in a very attractive format, forty-two short essays that originated as papers for presentation at a 1986 conference held as a complement--and something of a forthright rejoinder--to the roughly contemporaneous "IPSE" celebration, in Edinburgh, of the Scottish Enlightenment in general.

The case could be made, however, that both the Edinburgh event and its resulting memorial volume--David Daiches et al., *A Hot-Bed of Genius*--adopted a focus too narrow for a topic so controversial of definition and difficult to capture as "the Scottish Enlightenment." The Aberdeen conference, and thus the volume under review here, evidently emerged as an organized attempt to make just such a case, by broadening the customary geographical focus that virtually reduces the Scottish Enlightenment to its manifestations in the national capital.

The forces of Aberdonian revisionism would also have the *chronological* focus broadened, for any sustained attention to the complex relationships between the North-East and "the Enlightenment" necessarily leads to pressing questions about the importance of certain events and other, general phenomena of the early eighteenth and late seventeenth centuries as essential elements of the Scottish Enlightenment gestalt (if there was one).

Finally, even more interesting, perhaps, because most pointedly revisionist, is the third sense in which the Aberdonian rejoinder calls for greater breadth: the Scottish Enlightenment comprised so much more than its individual luminaries and its high-cultural achievements that to restrict one's historical focus to them is to overlook what was most important about "Enlightenment" in Scotland to most of the very people who promoted or encountered it, namely, its practical significance for the immediate community and for society at large.

Although these themes of Aberdonian revisionism are not everywhere in evidence throughout this motley collection, they are themes obviously dear to the editors and to most (especially the most Aberdeen-minded) of the authors represented. Moreover, I should hasten to add that, although the title of the volume does not convey it, this collection is (as was its parent conference) avowedly devoted almost as much to the topic of university culture generally in Aberdeen *during* the Enlightenment era as to the overlapping but analytically distinct and more vexed topic of the relationship between Aberdeen and the Enlightenment *per se*. Indeed, the editors could hardly be more faithful in representing the predominant orientation of their volume when they, in effect, specify that the principal relationship between eighteenth-century Aberdeen and the Enlightenment was a generalized didactic purpose that functioned as the common denominator of the culture of both.

At the very least, it seems safe to say that it was didactic purposefulness that proved to be the key to the successful exportation of the Aberdonian Enlightenment abroad, most notably to America. Thus the editors, in their Introduction, articulate the prevailing concern of the volume and reveal the heart of the matter of the often elusive historical topic their title announces when they write: "Students went from Aberdeen to the American and other colonies to export not merely the Scottish system of education but the Aberdeen priorities and standards: an awareness of the community and the individual's responsibility to it, the mutual respect and responsibilities of family and social life, and a reliance on education for the cultivation of moral worth and enlightened awareness which is the basis of a truly civilised society." (p. 5).

Still, for good or ill, each of the five sections into which the volume is divided exceeds, in the variety of its contents, the concerns (central or otherwise) of the Aberdonian revisionist school. In fact, there are several essays among the forty-two that have at most a tenuous bearing on anything specifically Aberdonian--or on "the Enlightenment," no matter how broadly that term is construed.

Among the five sections of the volume, ironically, it is the first that suffers least from the problem of dizzying variety in topics addressed. This section is entitled "The Enlightenment in Scotland and Abroad"; yet despite the generic nature of that rubric, the section, from beginning to end, should carry along any reader who has an interest in the history of the North-East--just as long as the reader also has some interest in politics, whether of the academic, the civil, or the ecclesiastical variety. Framed by bracing historiographical essays from the eminent and accomplished revisionists Donald J. Withrington and Anand C. Chitnis, this section touches on topics ranging from the origins, to the influences, to the interpretation of the Aberdonian Enlightenment. It also touches on points of geography as

distant from one another as Aberdeen, America, India, and Russia. But the emphasis on themes Aberdonian is seldom interrupted, and never for long.

The same must surely be said of the second section, "Enlightened Aberdeen." But here the attention to persons and matters Aberdonian tends to be, cumulatively, almost too exclusive and thus somewhat parochial--or too merely-appreciative. This tendency tends to weaken rather than strengthen the apparent but as yet unproved justice of the Aberdonian revisionist case. Thus, biographical information on the likes of George Turnbull and George Campbell, or conventional intellectual-history analysis of the ideas of those two familiar *penates*--or even of the earnest and worthy Thomas Reid himself, for that matter--would seem to have less to offer than what we learn from the essays in this section that recur to the fundamental tasks of comprehensive recovery and sophisticated organization of significant information on the social and institutional history of Enlightenment in Aberdeen. Elaborately documented essays on "the arts curriculum at Aberdeen at the beginning of the eighteenth century" and on the "two professoriates," at King's and Marischal Colleges from 1690 to 1800, are examples in point.

The third section, "Music and Art in the Enlightenment," is consistently interesting and scholarly but hardly consistent in Aberdonian emphasis. That this emphasis *can* be maintained, without sacrifice of rigorous and imaginative scholarship, is exemplified in the outstanding essay in this section, Kirsti Simonsuuri's elegant reprise of earlier work on Thomas Blackwell's remarkable, and at once Aberdonian and universal, appreciation in the *early* eighteenth century that "mythological thinking was the instrument of civilization" (p. 204).

"The Language and Bibliography of the Enlightenment," the fourth section, is notably successful in rehabilitating the announced themes of the volume, by means of essays most of which take individual figures--such as James Dunbar, James Beattie, or George Campbell--as occasions to discuss "great ideas" that are of long established interest to students of the Enlightenment, Scottish or otherwise. And the three especially short and informative bibliographic essays that conclude the section are of the essence of the Aberdonian revisionists' call to take seriously the material context of Enlightenment as a matter of palpable and general social significance.

The fifth section, "Literature of the Enlightenment," lapses, again, into overbreadth, with some essays on subjects entirely unrelated to Aberdeen, its region, or the Enlightenment (at least if one judges, as I do, that there never was any such thing as the Enlightenment in eighteenth-century England). Indeed, upon reading the essay by my countryman George McElroy on James and John Macpherson--which, in its first footnote, contrasts the reputed "homosexuality" of John with the "normality" of James--I found myself wondering whether the Enlightenment has *yet* reached all corners of the twentieth-century United States.

Ultimately, however, despite the occasionally puzzling variety and the inevitably variable quality of these essays, *Aberdeen and the Enlightenment* amounts to an admirable and useful volume. Alas, it would be even more useful were the index accurate and complete, so that this large, mixed collection could be consulted exhaustively on a selected topic with greater convenience.

Stephen A. Conrad, Indiana University

Ian Haywood, *The Making of History: A Study of the Literary Forgeries of James Macpherson and Thomas Chatterton in Relation to Eighteenth-Century Ideas of History and Fiction*. Rutherford, N.J.: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1986. Pp. 228.

Ian Haywood has taken a complicated topic in *The Making of History* and succeeded extraordinarily well. Building on the carefully designed foundation of his own 1983 University of London Ph.D. thesis and a well known (at least by Macpherson scholars) essay that appeared in the journal *Literature and History* in the same year, Haywood argues that the forgeries of Macpherson and Chatterton reveal the inconsistencies that existed in both the practice and theory of writing British history during that time. He points out that the practice of "using literature as a historical source and history as a literary topic" brought a major reevaluation of historical scholarship. In seven chapters, he convincingly describes the three principles that shaped the revelation: the effort to make history writing accountable to fact; the desire to define and write nationalist history; and the creation of a new form, social history.

The discussion of an evolving historical self-consciousness as it serves to prompt the accommodation of history into literature leads quite naturally to an analysis of Macpherson's work and to the treatment of Ossian as a self-conscious

historian. Haywood's point that Ossian was a voice of the past making his present and past seems exactly right--all the more so because he has explained Macpherson's often misunderstood strategy. His plan was "to make history" with a thoroughly nationalist character while making it a fit subject of poetry. In doing so, Macpherson discovered perfectly the desire of eighteenth-century Scots for a native epic.

Haywood has not discovered new facts or altered the basic understanding of the Macpherson story. However, he has explained clearly and analyzed thoroughly the contemporary historical atmosphere that would shape the writing of history and historical fiction into our time. He has also done Macpherson scholarship a considerable service by treating the poet and his work seriously and without prejudice.

Paul J. deGategno, North Carolina Wesleyan College

Ronald Hamowy, *The Scottish Enlightenment and the Theory of Spontaneous Order*. (Journal of the History of Philosophy Monograph Series). Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press, 1987. Pp. xii + 65.

Ronald Hamowy's short monograph is one that most students of eighteenth-century Scotland will find very useful. It defines "the single most significant sociological contribution" made by enlightened Scots, documents its presence in the works of Hume, Smith, Ferguson, Kames, Reid, Miller, Gilbert Stuart, and Dugald Stewart, and tries to show that they had an inadequate understanding of its potential as a bulwark for conservative views such as those that he thinks were held by Burke. The sociological principle is "the theory of spontaneous order," which "holds that the social arrangements under which we live are of such a high order of complexity that they invariably take their form not from deliberate calculation, but as the unintended consequences of countless individual actions, many of which may be the result of instinct and habit" (p. 3). Social institutions of whatever sort (languages, laws, economic arrangements, or morals) are, then, not the results of calculation but the spontaneous products of actions which had other immediate aims and which were not necessarily purposive or rational. This theory of order allowed the Scots to rid their social theories once and for all of the figure of the Legislator, just as it committed them to the belief "that there exist certain social rules [e.g. those of justice] that are so complex that they are beyond the comprehension of any mind and hence are not discernible by reason," an opinion which Hamowy says "derives from David Hume" (p. 6).

Though there were ancient Chinese and some modern statements of this doctrine, the author believes the Scots, not Bossuet, Vico, or Mandeville, were its important proponents. Perhaps one should add to this list Lucretius, whose early men "little by little had advanced life to its high plane" by thought, accident, instinct, and sheer toil but at the same time had "stirred up from the lowest depths the great seething tide of war," just as they had produced languages, governments and the arts (*On the Nature of Things*, bk. 5). Like Vico, the Scots were familiar with Lucretius's work, which Thomas Blackwell, Jr. had used before Hume in order to structure his own account of the ancient history of the Greeks, an account in which remedies for disorder produced the unintended consequences of successive social orders and economies. Hamowy's thinkers may be less innovative than he believes. With the exception of Hume, they would also have seen the orders generated by human actions as providential. Dugald Stewart could even find in "the inestimable treasure of new facts" produced by social, intellectual, and technical discoveries a full confirmation of "the scripture prophecy . . . 'Many shall go to and fro, and knowledge shall be increased.'" The result was that "the Genius of the human race seems, all at once, to have awakened with renovated and giant strength from his long sleep" (*Dissertation, exhibiting a General View of the Progress of . . . Philosophy*).

It is useful to cite this passage for another reason. Stewart, like others in Hamowy's list, believed in the "spirit of an age" or "a philosophic spirit" that also tended to assume the characteristics of a spontaneously generated order. Empiricism and its methods formed something rather analogous to the economic order which was produced by constant commerce among men given to bartering. Hamowy sticks almost exclusively to "social arrangements," but the ideological dimension of the thought of his subjects also deserves notice. Attending to that might help us to answer the questions posed by Ian Ross in the Forward to this study: "How did the Scots come to adopt this theory so pervasively in the eighteenth century, and perhaps more importantly, why did they do so?" (p. xii). One answer would be that it was because they still thought in religious, providential, and Calvinist terms. Perhaps that in the end

was the difference between them and Burke, who put a version of the theory to conservative and illiberal uses. However that may be, this is an interesting, useful work which should find many readers.

Roger L. Emerson, University of Western Ontario

Karl W. Schweizer, ed. *Lord Bute: Essays in Re-interpretation*. Leicester: Leicester University Press, 1988. Pp. xiv + 279.

Roger Mason, ed. *Scotland and England, 1286-1815*. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1987. Pp. viii + 270.

Nothing could more clearly reflect the lively interest in eighteenth-century Scottish politics and culture than the six relevant essays in these two volumes. Building on original and painstaking research, they demonstrate both innovation and insight. Even when one disagrees with the arguments in the various pieces, one comes away better informed about the practices and mentalities of their subjects.

For the big picture, begin with Alexander Murdoch's breathtaking tour through eighteenth-century Scottish government in *Lord Bute*. Anything but dull political history, this essay acutely explores the intricacies of Scottish political life with the touch of an historical anthropologist. First, Murdoch outlines the kinship structure, both real and fictitious, within which political alliances were made, pointing out that the eighteenth-century system of patronage was never a one-sided relationship; it involved a constant need for consultation and attention to local interests. Next, he illuminates the problems of Lord Bute, who together with his brother James Stuart Mackenzie was put into the unenviable position of attempting to reconcile the interests of two quite different socio-cultural entities--the Scots and the English. Finally, he demonstrates the ways in which the "Bute affair" gave rise to powerful and competing cultural myths. Wilkes became a symbol of all that was factious and detestable in Scotland, whereas for the English Bute long remained the archetypal corrupt adviser who sought to undermine the nation's ancient constitution. Such powerful mythical structures were not without significant practical ramifications for, as Murdoch suggests, the Wilkes affair caused the Scottish gentry and aristocracy to retreat from British political life and both necessitated and aggrandized an individual who would *manage* Scotland. The road to Henry Dundas was paved with taboos.

Murdoch concludes his paper with a reference to two of the greatest of Scottish totems, the concept of a larger *British* empire within which the Scots would play a more decisive role and the temporarily insular but potentially dynamic notion of the national bard. One of the greatest Scottish bards of the eighteenth century was John Home, the subject of Richard Sher's finely crafted contribution to the Bute volume. Sher's chief interest in Home has long been the way in which his life and work embodied those twin aspects of Scottish culture during the second half of the eighteenth century. For Home, like so many of his fellow literati, wore two quite different hats--that of patriot espousing material and civic concerns, and that of purveyor of sentiment whose plays helped to inculcate a peculiarly Scottish preoccupation with pathos and spectatorial sympathy. The play *Douglas*, so full of "arms" and "tears," demonstrates both elements at work. However, in this essay Sher concentrates on the London production of the greatly inferior tragedy *Agis* as "a test case of the relationship of ideology and politics in mid-eighteenth-century Britain." He skillfully demonstrates that *Agis* cannot be dismissed either as pure political propaganda of the Bute clique at Leicester House or as a naively objective account of heroic virtue. Such strands, Sher maintains, cannot be so easily disentangled in the minds and motives of eighteenth-century men and women, and those who would have it do so ignore the complex dialectic between a society and its culture. For Sher, plays like *Douglas* and *Agis* went far beyond the dictates of political expediency or propaganda. And, in his patronage of Home, Bute was indulging a virtuous, as well a political, self.

Bute's better self, however, is shown to greatest advantage in Roger Emerson's essay on Bute's role as a patron of the Scottish universities. In this detailed discussion of patronage and politics, illuminated by a careful consideration of the relevant correspondence, Emerson pinpoints the pivotal role played by Bute in consolidating the institutional character of the Scottish Enlightenment. As a political manager, Bute may have been inept, but as a patron of learning he most certainly was not. Bute supported the Moderate clergy, to which group his friend Home once belonged, and its program of politeness, tolerance, and improvement. He engineered or supported the appointments

of such men as John Millar, William Leechman, and Hugh Blair. As the case of Patrick Cuming and his son demonstrates, Bute was even willing to sacrifice political expediency in order to get the best man into the right place. Bute's contribution to Scottish institutional culture, concludes Emerson, can best be put into perspective by comparing his record with that of Henry Dundas. Virtually all of the latter's appointments put politics before teaching or scholarship.

As we have seen, Bute's twin role as English minister and Scottish patron raises significant questions about the intellectual and political relationship between John Bull and Sister Peg. That this relationship could stimulate sophisticated analysis is amply demonstrated in *Scotland and England*. The most challenging of the three eighteenth-century contributions, John Robertson's treatment of Andrew Fletcher of Saltoun, is nothing short of a complete transformation of our current picture of one of the key player's in the Union debate. By some regarded as a Scottish patriot whose fame derives from his staunch opposition to the Union, by others dismissed as a shallow and idiosyncratic writer, Fletcher becomes in Robertson's nimble hands the creator of an "extraordinarily complex intellectual artifice" that placed the debate on Scottish sovereignty and independence firmly within a cosmopolitan framework. Such a framework can only be fully appreciated, Robertson suggests, when one takes Fletcher's supposedly utopian discussion in the overlooked *Account of a Conversation* very seriously indeed.

Put simply, Robertson argues that Fletcher should be regarded as a thinker trained in the classical republican tradition who, in adapting the same in order to combat the claims of both Tommaso Campanella's argument for a universal Spanish monarchy and the potentially greater threat of an English commercial empire, drew on natural law theorists who delineated the proper relations between sovereign states. The concept of a balance of power between equal regions, which Fletcher presented in his *Account*, and which should be regarded as informing his opposition to the Union, "was of juristic, even Pufendorfian origin," Robertson argues. Fletcher's marriage of civic humanist and jurisprudential ideas has a striking resonance in light of recent debates between the proponents of civic humanism and of natural law as vehicles for understanding eighteenth-century Scottish culture and the Enlightenment.

But it remains debatable whether Fletcher's "remarkable achievement" will bear the weight of all the subtleties and ironies that Robertson ascribes to it. Those who have attempted to read Fletcher may not be as impressed by his genius, and Robertson's argument remains suggestive rather than conclusive. His admittedly fascinating evidence, especially in the case of the Neopolitan imprint to Fletcher's *Discorso delle Cose di Spagna*, requires considerably more textual and contextual evidence to support it. This, however, Robertson promises to provide in future publications.

Whereas Robertson's intriguing and timely essay asks us to consider a conjunction between the natural jurisprudential and civic humanist approaches to eighteenth-century Scottish thought, Nicholas Phillipson's "Politics, Politeness and the Anglicisation of Early Eighteenth-Century Scottish Culture" attempts to occupy a different and hotly disputed terrain. It is Phillipson's contention that the key to a proper understanding of eighteenth-century Scottish literary and intellectual life was its emphasis on practical moral interaction in the tradition of Addison's *Spectator*. It was Hume's remarkable achievement, argues Phillipson, to recast the *Spectator's* focus on communication and civility in terms of an enlightened defense of that increasingly commercial environment within which men sought both to secure their own interest and to live peaceably with others.

But Hume did not thereby dismiss constitutional and institutional considerations, argues Phillipson. Rather, he both continued and transcended the civic tradition of men like Andrew Fletcher. In his essay "The Idea of a Perfect Commonwealth," for example, Hume espoused a basically Fletcherian doctrine of autonomous regions that could secure maximum individual participation within a larger commercial universe. Unlike Fletcher, however, Hume was an unqualified enthusiast of commerce and its ability to stimulate the very values of polite Stoicism that men like Hume and Adam Smith so admired.

The genuine insights in Phillipson's essay are obscured, unfortunately, by a lack of appropriate references and definitions. Much is made of the role of Addison's *Spectator*, yet only three of its many hundreds of papers are cited and, of these citations, two are from Mr. Spectator's pantheon of odd and typical characters. Addison's fascinating blend of Stoic and Christian values is ignored, perhaps because its elaboration would weaken the case for his relationship with the skeptic Hume. Moreover, the tensions between a highly differentiated modern society and personal virtue, which obsessed the melancholic Addison, and which might help to explain a Scottish culture that could explore primitivism as well as improvement, are never discussed.

Scholars whose interpretations of Scottish culture differ from that of Phillipson may also be annoyed by his tendency to cite his own earlier but now modified work in order to buttress contentious points. Those who have worked on the Ciceronian and French roots of Hume's sentiments will undoubtedly find phrases such as the "distinctly English language of Addisonian politeness" rather extreme and limiting. Others may take issue with Phillipson's rather loose use of such terms as "neo-stoic" and "modern world." Finally, this reviewer takes exception to the sharp distinction that the author makes between "the intellectual activities of Edinburgh's wits" and the works of David Hume. Indeed, it is the former, rather than the latter, who clearly evidenced the profound influence of the Spectatorial tradition within eighteenth-century society.

One of the Gordian knots that Phillipson never satisfactorily unties is the revealing distinction between the *Spectator's* ethical plan to reach out to "every individual of the people" and Hume's much more elitist program for the cultivation of the "lucky few." Such an elitism runs to the heart of enlightened Scottish culture and helps to explain the reservations which Scots have held concerning it. Here, John Brims's essay on the Scottish "Jacobins" serves a useful function in illuminating the criticisms that many intelligent eighteenth-century Scotsmen had, not so much of the Union with England *per se*, but of the aristocratic hegemony that it consolidated and reinforced.

In his well-written contribution, Brims convincingly argues that the Scottish reformers of the late eighteenth century cannot be termed national republicans. With the exception of Thomas Muir, their orientation was decidedly British, made reference to British liberties rather than to an ancient Scottish constitution, and, as their rejection of the address of the Dublin society evidences, it encouraged pragmatism, not narrow patriotism. In its most radical, abstract, and underground form--that of the *United Scotsmen*--the reform movement clearly eschewed nationalism. Indeed, the Jacobins proved to be far less nationalistic than their English counterparts, since they were willing to seek aid from the French government in the cause of the rights of men.

Brims's account tantalizingly touches on the Scottish contribution to the idea of Britain, a concept with a long and interesting Scottish history, and one that is more fully developed in other essays in this valuable collection. Ironically it also provides a new historical spokesman for those who would view Scottish society and culture in terms of democratic and egalitarian nationhood. If Brims is correct, then it is Thomas Muir, rather than Andrew Fletcher, to whom the modern Scottish patriot should look.

John Dwyer, University of British Columbia

Andrew Hook, ed. *The History of Scottish Literature, Volume 2: 1660-1800*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press, 1987. Pp. ix + 337.

This is one of four volumes in Aberdeen University Press's history of Scottish literature from the Middle Ages to the twentieth century, and for both beginning and advanced students of eighteenth-century Scotland it will be an invaluable resource. It does for Scottish literature much the same thing that the Penguin Guide did for English literature, providing a provocative yet comprehensive introduction to various literary periods. Counting Hook's introduction, there are nineteen contributions, each of which is supplemented by suggested further reading; and there is a usable index of names and titles.

What is perhaps most impressive about the book is the wide range of the nineteen contributions. As Hook observes in his introduction, "it is the broad argument of this entire history of Scottish literature that the individual literary work is best understood within the widest possible cultural context--including, that is, all those social, political, economic, religious, and intellectual forces which together determine the nature of society at any given time." To the volume's great credit, this cultural context is not conceived as the usual "background," that is, as discrete chunks of information on politics, economics, religion/philosophy, social history, the arts, and the like, with the reader left to make connections between this "background" and the "foreground" of literature. Hook's plan is more daring, making no distinction between traditional background and foreground but instead giving equal treatment to themes and topics as well as to authors, and placing nonfictional genres on a par with fiction, poetry, and drama (an essential move in treating the Scottish Enlightenment). In addition, no single author or text was allowed to become the exclusive concern of any one contributor, so that virtually all authors and texts appear in multiple contexts. The effect is to break down the reader's traditional sense of what constitutes "literary" study

because ranged as full equals under the rubric of literature are not only poets, novelists, dramatists, and biographers but also antiquarians, historians, scientists, and philosophers. Fictional and nonfictional genres here become part of a single continuum explored from a variety of perspectives.

Some examples of the book's contents indicate its range. On the one hand, there are essays dealing with specifically literary topics: Alexander Kinghorn and Alexander Law on Allan Ramsay, Mary Jane Scott on James Thomson, Kenneth Simpson on Tobias Smollett, F. W. Freeman on Robert Fergusson, Gordon Turnbull on James Boswell, Alasdair Cameron on theater, and Carol McGuirk on Burns. Alongside these, however, we find essays on less specifically literary topics, including Geoffrey Carnall on historical writing, Ian Ross on aesthetics, Thomas Crawford on songs, and Derick Thomson on Gaelic poetry. Framing these eleven essays are seven others treating themes and topics. The first three contributions to the book treat cultural and political issues from 1660 to the early eighteenth century: Hugh Ouston discusses the continuity of Scottish culture from the Restoration to the Union, Iain Brown the problem of nationalism and antiquarianism after the Union, and Douglas Duncan the relationship of scholarship and poiliteness in the early eighteenth century. The four concluding essays address the cultural context of the later Enlightenment. These include Richard Sher on literature and the Church of Scotland, John Mullan on the language of sentiment, John Christie on the culture of science, and Andrew Hook on Scotland and Romanticism.

This arrangement is not without its risks and frustrations. For example, one wishes for an essay on Hume as a man of letters, especially if this book is intended, as it appears to be, for students relatively new to the subject. Having such a major figure discussed piecemeal in several essays may be decentering things too much. Similarly, some lesser figures perhaps deserve extended treatment. James Macpherson, for instance, emerges in this book as an important cultural (if not literary) figure, and one would have liked to see his significance explored more coherently. Yet these are precisely the sorts of questions the book is intended to raise. It is a stimulus for further exploration, not a definitive reference work designed to provide the "facts" of literary history. As such, it is a book no one interested in eighteenth-century Scotland can afford to miss.

Jeffrey Smitten, Texas Tech University

Leah Leneman, *Living in Atholl: A Social History of the Estates, 1685-1785*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1986. Pp xi + 244.

Dr. Leneman has quarried the Atholl Estate Papers and other local records to present a fascinating if inevitably patchy picture of economic and social life in Perthshire in the eighteenth century. Straddling the Lowland-Highland divide, there were marked differences between the two parts of the estate, not least in the use of Gaelic in the Highland half, but overall under the paternalist regime of successive dukes on the one hand and the determination of kirk sessions to keep a firm control over social and moral conduct on the other, the people of Atholl were generally more prosperous and more law-abiding than their more northerly countrymen. As a contemporary noted, "the Tenants . . . have a different Air from other Highlanders in the goodness of their Dress and the cheerfulness of their Countenances." Consequently the Fifteen and more particularly the Forty-Five came as unwelcome disruptions to most of the tenantry, despite their underlying Jacobite sympathies. Returning in 1745 from twenty-nine years exile following his participation in the Fifteen, the Jacobite Marquis of Tullibardine temporarily occupied the ancestral seat at Blair Atholl and assumed the title "Duke" William when his elder brother James, the second Duke, fled south. He boasted that he could raise over 2,000 men for this Prince but in the end could only muster a few hundred somewhat reluctant adherents, despite the brutal methods used. Duke James was similarly unsuccessful in raising troops for the Government side.

Richard Scott, Edinburgh

James G. Basker, *Tobias Smollett: Critic and Journalist*. Newark, Del.: University of Delaware Press, 1988. Pp. 358.

This is a very readable and solid study of Smollett's brief career as a journalist from 1756 until 1763. Smollett is now chiefly remembered as a novelist. But for seven years he was one of the leading critics and editors in London. Frustrated and embittered by his treatment at the hands of the reigning London literary establishment, he sought to replace it by an impartial academy of men of letters, which would support "authors of Merit." This academy was never established. In its place Smollett, together with three "Men of Approved Abilities"--Dr. John Armstrong, Rev. Thomas Francklin, and Rev. Patrick Murdoch--founded the *Critical Review* in 1756. Its aim was "to befriend Merit, dignify the Liberal Arts, and contribute towards the formation of a public Taste, which is the best Patron of Genius and Science." James Basker shows, in rich and convincing detail, how Smollett was the driving force and chief contributor to this influential periodical. Thanks to Basker's research, we now have a list of Smollett's contributions to this periodical. About 250 items have been tentatively added to the Smollett canon. Some of these items appeared in the *British Magazine*, another journal that Smollett founded and edited. Basker also argues that Oliver Goldsmith contributed many more essays and stories to this innovative magazine than had hitherto been suspected.

Anyone writing on eighteenth-century British topics will benefit from perusing this pioneering study. For Smollett's *Critical Review* and *British Magazine* had an immense influence throughout Great Britain and beyond. The anti-Scottish poet, Charles Churchill, asked rhetorically: "How could these self-elected monarchs raise/So large an empire on so small a base?" Basker's explanation for the extraordinary success of this "Scotch Tribunal" is compelling reading and will become required reading for anyone concerned with the Scottish contribution to the "democratization of culture."

David Raynor, University of Ottawa

Callum Brown, *The Social History of Religion in Scotland since 1730*. London: Methuen, 1987. Pp. xii + 273.

That the considerable mythology surrounding Scotland's religious past has interfered with our understanding of that history is one of the principal contentions of Callum Brown's brief, well-balanced survey of the social history of Scottish religion during the past two and half centuries. The Scottish religious heritage has so long been intertwined with issues of politics and national identity that the considerable diversity of religious groupings in Scotland, as well as the course of their development, have been obscured by partisan assertions of tradition and distinctiveness. Brown attempts to shift the focus away from the peculiarities of the Scottish story by applying to Scotland such universal categories of analysis as the pattern of denominationalism, the social basis of religion, the effects of urbanization and industrialization, and the growing secularization of more recent times. The work is thoughtful and informative. There is less on the period before 1800 than this audience would hope to find, but Brown's overall theme--that the lines of religious development in Scotland have broadly conformed to a general British pattern--will require substantial consideration by eighteenth-century historians.

Ned Landsman, State University of New York at Stony Brook

W. Hamish Fraser, *Conflict and Class: Scottish Workers, 1700-1838*. Edinburgh: John Donald, 1988. Pp. vii + 202.

It is one of the paradoxes of Scottish culture that a nation so heavily committed to the social and political values associated with the word "labor" should be historiographically backward in the field of labor history. Hamish Fraser's book on the development of a "trade union consciousness" among Scottish tradesmen is therefore most welcome. Using previously neglected legal records, as well as other sources, he convincingly demonstrates that the journeymen in a variety of Scottish trades were actively involved in forming combinations during the eighteenth century. Sometimes they did so for purposes of mutual aid, other times to join forces against the masters of their respective incorporations to demand higher pay or at least to prevent the masters from cutting their real wages any further. There were strikes, imprisonments, and surprisingly sophisticated legal maneuverings in the courts. If the climax of

the story does not come until the 1820s and 30s, when a strong working class identity emerged, the author shows that the roots of that identity lay in the sporadic but highly significant activities of forgotten eighteenth-century organizations such as the Edinburgh Journeymen Tailors' Society.

Though Fraser takes care not to push his arguments further than his data will allow, he fills the book with fascinating insights into the social structure of eighteenth-century Scotland. The transformation of masters and journeymen in a particular trade from members of a unified corporate body into antagonistic employers and workers; the importance of the courts and paternalistic JP's in resolving labor disputes; and the incessant pressure of demographic redistribution are among the themes that recur again and again. All in all this pioneering book is yet another indication of the leading roles being played by the history faculty at University of Strathclyde and the Edinburgh publisher John Donald, Ltd. in raising the standards of Scottish social and economic history.

Richard B. Sher, New Jersey Institute of Technology

New ECSSS Members (May 1988)

Last spring's newsletter printed a list of 122 members, most of whom have renewed their memberships this year. The list below includes the names of 69 more members who have joined ECSSS during the past twelve months. Institutional affiliations and fields of interest are noted when known.

Marcia Allentuck, Art/Lit, City U. of New York: literature and the arts
Yasuo Amoh, Econ, Kochi U. (Japan): SE; Smith & Ferguson
Andrew Argus-Smith, Hist
John Ashmead, Lit, Haverford (ret.): song; Burns
Barbara Benedict, Lit, Trinity College: John Home; sentimentalism & satire in the novel
Stefan Bielinski, Hist, New York State Museum: Scots in American communities
Dorothy Boyd-Rush, Hist, James Madison, Andrew Robertson; transplanted Scots; diaries
John D. Brims, Hist, St. Andrews U.: politics & society
W. A. Brogden, Arch, Aberdeen U.: architecture; landscape; urban design
Terence Brotherstone, Hist, Aberdeen U.: antecedents of Marxism & historiography in the SE
Caillum Brown, Hist, Strathclyde U.: social & ecclesiastical history
Mary T. Cargill, Lit, Christian Brothers College: Smollett; Boswell; towns; architecture
Anand C. Chitnis, Hist, Stirling U.: social, political & intellectual history
Henry C. Clark, Hist, Canisius College: moral theory & its relation to social thought
Hamilton E. Cochrane, Lit, Canisius College: Boswell
Dorothy Coleman, Phil, Bowdoin College/Hume Society: Hume
Margaret Crocco, Oak Knoll School (Summit, NJ)
A.J.G. Cummings, Hist, Strathclyde U.: York Buildings Company in economy & society
David Daiches, Lit: literature; culture
Melvin Dalgarno, Phil, Aberdeen U.: philosophy
Jennifer L. Davis, Hist, Old Dominion U.: ethnic studies; intellectual/social history; literature; women
John Davison, Mus, Haverford College: songs of Robert Burns
Paul Dickler, Hist, Neshaminy High School (Doylestown, PA): SE; emigration
Jane B. Fagg, Hist, Arkansas College: Adam Ferguson
W. Hamish Fraser, Hist, Strathclyde U.: popular protest; workers' movements
Frederick S. Gill, Scottish Historic & Research Society of the Delaware Valley: history; art; music
Mark Goldie, Hist, Cambridge U.: Scottish Catholic Enlightenment
Joseph Hamburger, Pol, Yale U.: James Mackintosh; Francis Jeffrey; Edinburgh Review; "invisible hand"
Ellen C. Haydar, Hist, Friends Select School (Philadelphia, PA)
George A.K.W. Hickrod, Ed, Scottish American Society of Central Illinois: education; America; "Whig" clans
Steve Hicks, Lit, James Madison U.: Walter Scott; James Thomson; aesthetics

Lore H. Hisky, Hist, Central High School (Memphis, TN): architecture; arts; SE
 James R. Irvine, Lit, Colorado State U.: rhetorical theory
 Thomas D. Kennedy, Phil/Hist, Austin Peay State U.: philosophy & theology, esp. Hutcheson, Reid, Ferguson
 Laura Kennelly, Phil, U. of North Texas: Hume
 Anne McClenny Krauss, Mus: Scottish and American music
 Linda M. Kruger, Lib, Columbia U.
 Colby H. Kullman, Lit, U. of Mississippi: Boswell
 Robert Lawson-Peebles, Lit, Aberdeen U.: William Smith; Scottish-American relations
 Irma S. Lustig, Lit, U. of Pennsylvania: Boswell
 Robert P. Maccubbin, Lit, College of William and Mary
 Malcolm Macpherson-Smith, Hist, Old Dominion U. (postgrad)
 Warren McDougall, Lit: book trade
 JoAnne Mottola, Hist, Temple U. (postgrad): Scottish migration to Philadelphia
 Stana Nenadic, Hist, Edinburgh U.: urban middle class family; occupation & wealth structures
 N. T. Phillipson, Hist, Edinburgh U.: SE
 Susan Proviance, Phil, U. of Toledo: Hutcheson; ethics
 John Radner, Lit, George Mason U.: Boswell; philosophy & psychology; literary criticism
 Peter Reed, Arch, Strathclyde U.: architecture; town planning
 Thomas C. Richardson, Lit, North Carolina State U.: literature; education
 Wade Robison, Phil, Kalamazoo College: Hume
 Terence Rodgers, Hist, Bath College of Higher Education: culture & capitalism
 Richard Scott, Hist: politics & administration to 1750
 Laura S. Seitz, Croton-Harmon High School (Croton-on-Hudson, NY)
 Jeremy Shearmur, George Mason U.: SE, especially Adam Smith
 Hisashi Shinohara, Econ, Kwansei-Gakuin U. (Japan): Thomas Reid, Adam Smith, & the SE
 Fiona J. Stafford, Lit, British Academy: James Macpherson & Ossian
 Mary M. Stewart, Lit, Gettysburg: Boswell; political & military history; Church of Scotland
 Blair C. Stonier, Scottish Historic & Research Society of the Delaware Valley
 Rosalie M. Stott, HS, McMaster U.: medicine; physicians, surgeons, midwives; trades associations
 Rita Tessmann, Lit, Westminster College: Boswell; travel literature; estates
 Gordon Turnbull, Lit, Yale U.: Boswell; Hume; SE; women writers
 H. Lewis Ulman, Lit, Ohio State U.: rhetoric
 Craig Walton, Phil, U. of Nevada: moral philosophy; logic
 Eleanor F. Wedge, Caledonian Club of New York: literature & art
 Alice J. Wheeler, Hist, Spelman College: historiography
 Arthur H. Williamson, Hist, New York U.: social theory; secularization
 Virginia Wills, Hist, Bridge of Allan Books: Highlands and Islands in the late eighteenth century.
 John Wright, Phil, U. of Windsor: medicine; epistemology; philosophy

Abbreviations: Arch—architecture/decorative arts; Econ—economics; Ed—education; HS—history of science/medicine; Hist—history; Lib—library; Lit—literature; Mus—music; Phil—philosophy; Pol—politics. SE=Scottish Enlightenment.

Eighteenth-Century Scotland is published annually by the Eighteenth-Century Scottish Studies Society (ECSSS) and is sent to all ECSSS members each spring. Submissions of articles, announcements, and news items are welcome. Address all correspondence to Richard B. Sher, Executive Secretary--ECSSS, New Jersey Institute of Technology, Newark, NJ 07102, USA.

ECSSS officers for 1988-90: President: Roger Emerson; Vice-President: Jeffrey Smitten; Executive Secretary/Treasurer: Richard Sher; Members-at-Large: Robert Kent Donovan, Susan Purviance.

Special thanks to New Jersey Institute of Technology for providing desktop publishing facilities.

Renew Now for 1988-89--and Tell a Friend about ECSSS

In an effort to provide our members with the best possible service at the lowest possible cost, ECSSS has expanded its newsletter while freezing our individual membership dues at just five U.S. dollars or four pounds sterling--payable in either U.S. or U.K. currency (institutional memberships: ten dollars or eight pounds).

Please help us to keep prices down by using this form to renew your subscription and by copying it for circulation among other people who might be interested in joining. We would also appreciate it if members would bring our society to the attention of their libraries.

If you wish to make a contribution to a fund being established to award an annual prize for the best publication(s) in eighteenth-century Scottish studies, all donations will be greatly appreciated.

Name _____

Address _____

Institutional Position/Affiliation (if any) _____

Fields of Interest in 18th-Century Scotland _____

Checks should be made out to "ECSSS". Send membership form with fee to Richard B. Sher, Executive Secretary--ECSSS, New Jersey Institute of Technology, Newark, NJ 07102, USA.

Eighteenth-Century Scotland
Department of Humanities
New Jersey Institute of Technology
Newark, NJ 07102 USA